

Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries

And a brief introduction to quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area

April 2018

Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries

*And a brief introduction to quality assurance in the European Higher
Education Area*

Goran Dakovic, EUA
Maria Kelo and Paula Ranne, ENQA

Prepared by the HAQAA Initiative Consortium on behalf of the European and African Union Commissions

April 2018

This document has been prepared for the European Union Commission and the African Union Commission however it reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commissions cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

More information about the HAQAA Initiative available online at:
<https://haqaa.aau.org/>

Contents

Foreword.....	5
1. Introduction.....	5
2. Overview of the existing standards and guidelines in Africa.....	6
3. Northern Africa	16
3.1 Internal QA.....	16
4. Eastern Africa	20
4.1 Internal QA.....	20
4.2 External QA.....	27
4.3 Standards and guidelines for internal QA for Open and Distance Learning.....	29
4.4 QA of quality assurance agencies.....	31
5. Southern Africa	32
5.1 Internal QA.....	32
5.2 External QA.....	40
5.3 Standards and guidelines for internal QA for Open and Distance Learning.....	42
5.4 QA of quality assurance agencies.....	43
6. Western Africa.....	45
6.1 Internal QA.....	45
7. Central Africa	49
7.1 Internal QA.....	49
8. Creation of the European Higher Education Area	51
8.1 The Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area	52
8.2 Implementation of the ESG and the external review system of QA agencies in Europe.....	52
8.3 Quality procedures in the EHEA.....	53
9. Annexes.....	56
10. References.....	57

Tables

Table 1: List of quality assurance bodies in African countries.....	6
Table 2: List of regional networks in Africa that provide standards and guidelines in QA.....	9
Table 3: Comparison of fields that are covered by the standards and guidelines for internal quality assurance in African countries	10
Table 4: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Northern African countries.....	11
Table 5: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Eastern African countries	12
Table 6: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Southern African countries	13
Table 7: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Western African countries.....	14
Table 8: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Central African countries.....	15
Table 9: Table of international and regional standards and guidelines for quality assurance.....	55

Figures

Figure 1: Map of countries with national standards and guidelines in quality assurance in Africa (marked yellow).....	9
---	---

Foreword

Quality assurance of higher education is a policy priority in most African nations. As universities are increasingly seen as drivers for further economic and social development throughout the continent, the concern for quality of provision of teaching, research and societal engagement is gaining more focus. At the same time, universities are challenged by ever more diversified and larger student body and by demands to operate in an increasingly international context. In such circumstances, a guiding document that will foster a common understanding of quality assurance across different national contexts is essential. The ‘Harmonisation of African Quality Assurance and Accreditation’ (HAQAA) Initiative¹ aims at developing such document, i.e. African Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ASG-QA). The development of the ASG-QA has already been a commitment of the Pan African Quality Assurance and Accreditation Framework (PAQAF), a politically endorsed framework of the African Union which outlines a number of tools and instruments needed to harmonise quality assurance in higher education in Africa.

In delivering the ASG-QA, the HAQAA Initiative first had to consider the previous and current work that has been done in the African sub-regions, European Higher Education Area (EHEA) and other regions concerning standards and guidelines in QA.

This mapping study covers the five African sub-regions and presents the existing standards and guidelines for internal QA, external QA, QA of Open and Distance Learning, and QA of quality assurance agencies. The collected data is aimed at incorporating the existing work on QA in Africa into the African Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance, so as to foster a common continental framework in QA and enhanced quality culture in higher education, based on what already exists.

1. Introduction

The European Union and the African Union, in the context of the Africa-EU Strategic Partnership, have selected ‘harmonisation, quality and accreditation’ as a primary action line for their support to the higher education sector, in which special attention is given to regional collaboration and harmonisation of QA measures in the African continent. To implement this, a service contract funded by the European Union between December 2015 and November 2018 was launched, entitled ‘Harmonisation of African Quality Assurance and Accreditation’ (HAQAA). Activities of the HAQAA Initiative address a number of measures and facets that are critical to building quality assurance and accreditation on a pan-African level, in a comprehensive manner. HAQAA ultimately contribute to implementing PAQAF – The Pan African Quality Assurance and Accreditation Framework, which has been approved by the African Union and frames these different measures.

One of the primary activities of the Initiative and of the PAQAF is to develop the African Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance (ASG-QA). This will be a guiding document for quality assurance agencies (QAAs) and higher education institutions (HEIs) across the continent and will be instrumental in fostering a shared quality culture and eventually in facilitating the cross-border recognition of quality assurance and accreditation decisions. The ASG-QA will consider and incorporate previous and current work that is being done in the African sub-regions as well as the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG)² and other similar documents that have been developed in other regions and are harmonising higher education. This report was initially prepared to be a supporting background document for the Technical Working Group of the HAQAA Initiative, which has been responsible for the drafting of the ASG-QA.

¹ The HAQAA Initiative’s website is available at: <https://haqaa.aau.org/>

² Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (2015). Available at: <http://www.enqa.eu/index.php/home/esg/>

For this purpose, the existing institutional standards and guidelines in QA in African countries have been collected and mapped. Firstly, the standards and guidelines have been grouped based on the region of their origin (Northern, Eastern, Southern, Western, and Central Africa) as a means to identify possible regional characteristics (i.e. number of existing standards and guidelines, their similarities and collaboration in regional networks regarding QA) that might support or hinder further harmonisation of QA measures in the African context. Furthermore, the standards and guidelines have been divided into four additional subgroups: standards and guidelines for internal QA at institutions, external QA, QA of QAAs, and standards and guidelines for internal QA of Open and Distance Learning.

In addition, the report presents a section concerning QA practices in Europe. This section introduces the background of the Bologna Process and its development (EHEA, 2017). Also, the ESG are introduced as the core document for internal and external QA in the EHEA (ENQA 2017, EQAR 2017). The developments in Europe provide an example of a continent-wide harmonisation process in QA which can serve as an experience for Africa to consider. The ESG were drafted by the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA), the European Students' Union (ESU), the European Association of Institutions in Higher Education (EURASHE) and the European University Association (EUA) in cooperation with Education International (EI), BUSINESSEUROPE and the European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education (EQAR). It is agreed that the ESG were prepared by the core stakeholders in European higher education, thus allowing for a wide acceptance throughout higher education community. Moreover, in Europe it has proved crucial that the ESG allow for diverse approaches to QA and for ensuring that QA systems are truly fit for purpose, answering the specific needs of the range of higher education systems found on the continent, while at the same time supporting cohesion and transparency.

2. Overview of the existing standards and guidelines in Africa

The list of standards and guidelines included in this report is not exclusive. Rather, the document should be seen as a working material to be further built up with additional standards and guidelines that come to light during the HAQAA Initiative. The standards and guidelines that are mapped below were collected from October 2016 to November 2017 and follow the terminology as used in the source documents.

Prior to listing the existing standards and guidelines in QA in African countries, table 1 summarises the bodies that deal with QA in these countries. The regional networks are presented separately in table 2. Table 3 then presents the comparison of fields that are covered by the standards and guidelines for internal QA in five African sub-regions (summarised in tables 4 to 8).

Table 1: List of QA bodies in African countries

Region ³	Country	Agency or another body responsible for QA (with link to the website where existing)	Established ⁴	National SGs for internal QA as found and included in this mapping study	Standards and guidelines (SG) from the membership organisation are applied
Northern	Algeria	Ministere de l'Enseignement Superieur et de la Recherche Scientifique National Commission for Quality Assurance Implementation in Higher Education (CIAQES)		YES	
Northern	Egypt	National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education (NAQAAE)	2007	YES	YES (ANQAHE)
Northern	Libya	The Executive Committee for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ECQAHE)	2005		YES (ANQAHE)

³ Based on United Nation's list of geographic regions (2018).

⁴ Okebukola, 2014.

The HAQAA Initiative · Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries with an introduction to quality assurance in Europe

Region ³	Country	Agency or another body responsible for QA (with link to the website where existing)	Established ⁴	National SGs for internal QA as found and included in this mapping study	Standards and guidelines (SG) from the membership organisation are applied
Northern	Morocco	Agence Nationale d'Evaluation et d'Assurance Qualité de l'enseignement supérieur et de la recherche scientifique (ANEAQ)			Yes (FrAQ-Sup) Yes(ANQAHE)
Northern	Sudan	Evaluation and Accreditation Corporation (EVAC)	2002		YES (ANQAHE)
Northern	Tunisia	Instance Nationale de l'Evaluation, de l'Assurance Qualité et de l'Accréditation (IEAOA)	1995		
Northern	Western Sahara				
Eastern	Burundi	National Commission for Higher Education (NCHE)	2011		YES (CAMES) YES (IUCEA)
Eastern	Comoros				
Eastern	Djibouti				
Eastern	Eritrea				
Eastern	Ethiopia	Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA)	2003	YES	
Eastern	Kenya	Commission for University Education (CUE)	1985	YES	YES (IUCEA)
Eastern	Madagascar	Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche Scientifique (MESUPRES)			YES (CAMES) YES (SADC)?
Eastern	Malawi	Malawi Bureau of Standards (MBS)		YES	YES (SADC)
Eastern	Mauritius	<u>Mauritius Qualifications Authority (MQA)</u>	1997	YES	YES (SADC)
Eastern	Mayotte				
Eastern	Mozambique	<u>Conselho Nacional de Avaliação da Qualidade do Ensino Superior (CNAQ)</u> -National Council for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education (CNAQ)	2003	YES	YES (SADC)
Eastern	Reunion			ESG	
Eastern	Rwanda	<u>Higher Education Council</u>	2006	YES ⁵	YES (IUCEA) YES (CAMES) - partly
Eastern	Seychelles	<u>Seychelles Qualifications Authority (SOA)</u>		NO ⁶	YES (SADC)
Eastern	Somalia				
Eastern	Tanzania	<u>The Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU)</u>	2005	YES	YES (SADC) YES (IUCEA)
Eastern	Uganda	<u>National Council for Higher Education (NCHE)</u>	2001	YES (but programme ones)	YES (IUCEA)
Eastern	Zambia	<u>Higher Education Authority (HEA)</u>		YES	YES (SADC)
Eastern	Zimbabwe	<u>Zimbabwe Council for Higher Education (ZIMCHE)</u>	2006	YES	YES (SADC)
Southern	Botswana	<u>Botswana Qualifications Authority (BOA)</u>	1999		YES (SADC)
Southern	Lesotho	<u>Commission for Higher Education (CHE)</u>	2004	YES	YES (SADC)
Southern	Namibia	<u>National Council for Higher Education (NCHE)</u>	2004	YES	YES (SADC)

⁵ For internal QA for Open and Distance Learning.

⁶ Programme level criteria that are used for programme validation.

The HAQAA Initiative · Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries with an introduction to quality assurance in Europe

Region ³	Country	Agency or another body responsible for QA (with link to the website where existing)	Established ⁴	National SGs for internal QA as found and included in this mapping study	Standards and guidelines (SG) from the membership organisation are applied
Southern	South Africa	Council on Higher Education (CHE)	1998	YES	YES (SADC)
Southern	Swaziland	Swaziland Higher Education Council			YES (SADC)
Western	Benin	Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche Scientifique			YES (CAMES)
Western	Burkina Faso	Conseil Africain et Malgache Pour L'Enseignement Supérieur (CAMES)			YES (CAMES)
Western	Cape Verde				
Western	Ivory Coast				YES (CAMES)
Western	Gambia	National Accreditation and Quality Assurance Authority (NAQAA)		YES?	
Western	Ghana	National Accreditation Board (NAB)	1993	YES	
Western	Guinea				YES (CAMES)
Western	Guinea-Bissau				YES (CAMES)
Western	Liberia	National Commission on Higher Education (NCHE)	2000		
Western	Mali	Direction Nationale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche Scientifique (DNESRS)			YES (CAMES)
Western	Mauritania				
Western	Niger				YES (CAMES)
Western	Nigeria	National Universities Commission (NUC)	1974	YES	
Western	Saint Helena				
Western	Senegal	Autorite Nationale d'Assurance Qualite de l'Enseignement Supérieur (ANAQ-SUP)	2012	YES	YES (CAMES)
Western	Sierra Leone				
Western	Togo	Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de la Recherche Scientifique			YES (CAMES)
Central	Angola	Instituto Nacional de Avaliação e Acreditação do Ensino Superior (INAES)			YES (SADC)
Central	Cameroon	Ministry of Higher Education (National Commission on Private Higher Education (NCPHE))	1991		YES (CAMES)
Central	Central African Republic	Comité ad'hoc de Coordination du dispositif de l'Assurance Qualité pour l'Enseignement Supérieur Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur			YES (CAMES)
Central	Chad				YES (CAMES)
Central	Democratic Republic of the Congo	Agence Nationale D'Assurance Qualite (ANAQ)		YES	YES (CAMES) YES (SADC) - partly
Central	Republic of the Congo				YES (CAMES)
Central	Equatorial Guinea				
Central	Gabon				YES (CAMES)
Central	São Tomé and Príncipe				

The HAQAA Initiative · Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries with an introduction to quality assurance in Europe

Table 3: Comparison of fields that are covered by the standards and guidelines for internal QA in African countries

Standards and guidelines for internal QA	Algeria	ANQAHE	CAMES	Egypt	Ethiopia	Gambia	Ghana	IUCEA	Kenya	Lesotho	Malawi	SA ⁷	Mauritius	Mozambique	Namibia	Nigeria	SADC	Senegal	Zambia	Zimbabwe	DRC ⁸
Vision, mission, objectives, strategic planning	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Governance, administration, leadership, constituency, autonomy (including financial and logistical dimension)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓		✓	✓				✓		✓	✓	✓
Study programmes ⁹	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Research	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			✓	✓	✓		✓		✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Quality assurance (institutional self-evaluation), including of study programmes separately	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓			✓	✓
Facilities, physical resources, infrastructure (mostly ICT)	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
Staff ¹⁰	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Students, alumni, student support services, students with special needs	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓	✓	✓				✓	✓	✓		✓			✓	✓
Learning and teaching	¹¹			✓	✓				✓	✓		✓	✓		✓						
Financial resources		✓	✓	✓		✓	✓		✓			✓			✓	✓	✓		✓		✓
Community engagement,	✓	✓	✓	✓		✓			✓	✓		✓	✓		✓			✓			✓

⁷ South Africa.

⁸ Democratic Republic of the Congo.

⁹ Study programme development, implementation, review, grants of awards of qualifications, curriculum, student admission and retention, progression and monitoring of graduate outcomes, general education.

¹⁰ Including academic and administrative staff, technical and service staff, including human resource management.

¹¹ Lifelong learning.

The HAQAA Initiative · Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries with an introduction to quality assurance in Europe

Standards and guidelines for internal QA	Algeria	ANQAHE	CAMES	Egypt	Ethiopia	Gambia	Ghana	IUCEA	Kenya	Lesotho	Malawi	SA ⁷	Mauritius	Mozambique	Namibia	Nigeria	SADC	Senegal	Zambia	Zimbabwe	DRC ⁸
Industrial partnerships																					
Academic integrity, ethics, social responsibility		✓	✓	✓		✓			✓								✓			✓	✓
Management of information and communication	✓		✓	¹²		✓		✓		✓	✓							✓			✓
Modes of delivery									✓								✓			✓	
Internationalisation				¹³						✓			✓	✓							
Post-graduate studies	✓			✓									✓		✓						
Health and safety						✓														✓	✓
Recognition of prior learning (RPL)												✓									

Table 4: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Northern African countries

Region	Country	Author	Document title	Year	Type of standards (internal QA, external QA, or QA of QAAs)	Number of standards	Source	Website
Northern	Algeria	Ensemble pour la Qualité (CIAQES/MESRS)	Référentiel National de l'Assurance Qualité. Domaines, Champs, Références	2016	Internal	7 groups, 31 standards	Annex XXII	Click here
Northern	Egypt	National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education (NAQAAE)	National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education (NAQAAE) Accreditation Standards for HEIs	2015	Internal	12	Annex V	Click here
Northern	Morocco	Agence Nationale d'Evaluation et d'Assurance Qualité de l'enseignement supérieur et de la recherche scientifique (ANEAQ) avec l'assistance de l'UE	Reférentiels d'évaluation (the document will be finalised by the end of 2017)	2017	External			
Northern	More countries (headq. in Bahrain, influence)	The Arab Network for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ANQAHE)	Common Institutional Standards in the Arab States	No data	Internal	11	Annex XVI	/

¹² Present as a criterion under the standard 'Governance'.

¹³ Present as multiple criteria/practices of internationalisation under relevant standards.

The HAQAA Initiative · Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries with an introduction to quality assurance in Europe

Region	Country	Author	Document title	Year	Type of standards (internal QA, external QA, or QA of QAAs)	Number of standards	Source	Website
	on some African countries)							

Table 5: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Eastern African countries

Region	Country	Author	Document title	Year	Type of standards (internal QA, external QA, or QA of QAAs)	Number of standards	Source	Website
Eastern	Ethiopia	Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA)	HERQA Institutional Audit Procedure	2006	Internal	10	Annex XVII	Click here
Eastern	Ethiopia	Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA)	Quality Assurance Policy	2014	External	4	Annex XVIII	Click here
Eastern	Kenya	Commission for University Education	Universities Standards and Guidelines	2014	Internal	16	Annex VI	Click here
Eastern	Kenya	Commission for University Education	Standards and Guidelines for Open, Distance and E-learning (ODEL)	2013	Internal (for Open and Distance Learning)	27	Annex XIII	No direct link, but click here
Eastern	Malawi	Malawi Bureau of Standards (MSB)	Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in Malawi's higher education institutions	No data	Internal	7	Annex XIX	Click here
Eastern	Malawi	Malawi Bureau of Standards (MSB)	Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in Malawi's higher education institutions	No data	External	8	Annex XIX	Click here
Eastern	Malawi	Malawi Bureau of Standards (MSB)	Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in Malawi's higher education institutions	No data	QA agencies	8	Annex XIX	Click here
Eastern	Mauritius	Tertiary Education Commission	Regulatory Framework for Postsecondary Education, Criteria for Academic Audit	No data	Internal	18	Annex XIV	Click here
Eastern	Mozambique	Conselho Nacional de Avaliacao de Qualidade do Ensino Superior (CNAQ)	Mapa de indicadores, padrões e critérios de verificação	No data	Internal	9	Annex VII	Click here
Eastern	Rwanda	Higher Education Council, Rwanda	Standards and Guidelines for Open and Distance Learning	No data	Internal (for Open and	28	Annex III	Click here

The HAQAA Initiative · Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries with an introduction to quality assurance in Europe

Region	Country	Author	Document title	Year	Type of standards (internal QA, external QA, or QA of QAAs)	Number of standards	Source	Website
					Distance Learning)			
Eastern	Tanzania	Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU)	Quality Assurance General Guidelines and Minimum Standards for Provision of University Education in Tanzania	2014	Internal	No data	Annex IV	Click here
Eastern	Zambia	The Higher Education Authority	The Quality Assurance System for Higher Education in Zambia	2015	Internal	7 core, 3 non-core	Annex XXIII	Click here
Eastern	Zimbabwe	Zimbabwe Council for Higher Education	Quality Assurance Standards for Higher Education	No data	Internal	15	Annex II	Click here
Eastern	More countries (headq. in Uganda)	Inter-university Council for East Africa (IUCEA)	Principles and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education in Eastern Africa	2014	External	5	Annex I	Click here
Eastern	More countries (headq. in Uganda)	Inter-university Council for East Africa (IUCEA)	Principles and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education in Eastern Africa	2014	Internal	10	Annex I	Click here

Table 6: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Southern African countries

Region	Country	Author	Document title	Year	Type of standards (internal QA, external QA, or QA of QAAs)	Number of standards	Source	Website
Southern	Lesotho	Council on Higher Education (CHE)	Institutional Audit Framework for Higher Education	No data	Internal	16	Annex VIII	Click here
Southern	Namibia	National Council for Higher Education (NCHE)	Quality Assurance System for Higher Education in Namibia	2009	Internal	16	Annex XII	Click here
Southern	Namibia	National Council for Higher Education (NCHE)	Quality Assurance System for Higher Education in Namibia	2009	External	8	Annex XII	Click here
Southern	South Africa	Council on Higher Education (CHE)	Criteria for Institutional Audits	2004	Internal	19	Annex X	Click here
Southern	More countries (headq. in Botswana)	The Southern Africa Development Community (SADC), Technical Committee on Certification and Accreditation (TCCA)	Proposed Common Guidelines for Coordinating Education Quality Assurance in the SADC Region	2008	Internal	13	Annex XI	/

The HAQAA Initiative · Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries with an introduction to quality assurance in Europe

Region	Country	Author	Document title	Year	Type of standards (internal QA, external QA, or QA of QAAs)	Number of standards	Source	Website
Southern	More countries (headq. in Botswana)	The Southern Africa Development Community (SADC), Technical Committee on Certification and Accreditation (TCCA)	Proposed Common Guidelines for Coordinating Education Quality Assurance in the SADC Region	2008	External	4	Annex XI	/
Southern	More countries (headq. in Botswana)	The Southern Africa Development Community (SADC), Technical Committee on Certification and Accreditation (TCCA)	Proposed Common Guidelines for Coordinating Education Quality Assurance in the SADC Region	2008	Internal (for Open and Distance Learning)	8	Annex XI	/
Southern	More countries (headq. in Botswana)	The Southern Africa Development Community (SADC), Technical Committee on Certification and Accreditation (TCCA)	Proposed Common Guidelines for Coordinating Education Quality Assurance in the SADC Region	2008	QA agencies	21	Annex XI	/

Table 7: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Western African countries

Region	Country	Author	Document title	Year	Type of standards (internal QA, external QA, or QA of QAAs)	Number of standards	Source	Website
Western	Gambia	National Training Authority	Registration and Accreditation for Training Providers	2007	Internal	7	Annex XXIV	Click here
Western	Ghana	National Council for Tertiary Education	Norms for Tertiary Education (Universities)	2012	Internal	5	Annex XXI	Click here
Western	Nigeria	National Universities Commission (NUC)	Benchmark Minimum Academic Standards (BMAS) documents, classified into 13 major disciplines for Nigerian universities	2007	Internal	Varies per document	Annex XX	/
Western	Senegal	Autorite Nationale D'assurance Qualite De L'enseignement Superieur (ANAQ-SUP)	Referentiel D'Evaluation Institutionnelle	2013	Internal	31	Annex XV	Click here
Western	More countries (headq. in Burkina Faso)	Conseil Africain et Malgache Pour L'Enseignement Superieur (CAMES)	Appui a L'Assurance Qualite de l'Enseignement Superieur et de la Recherche dans les pays de l'espace CAMES	2014	Internal	18	Annex IX	Click here

The HAQAA Initiative · Mapping of the existing standards and guidelines in quality assurance in African countries with an introduction to quality assurance in Europe

Table 8: Overview of mapped standards and guidelines for Central African countries

Region	Country	Author	Document title	Year	Type of standards (internal QA, external QA, or QA of QAAs)	Number of standards	Source	Website
Central	Democratic Republic of the Congo	Agence Nationale D'Assurance Qualite (ANAQ)	Referentiel D'Evaluation Institutionnelle	2016	Internal	17	Annex XXV	/

3. Northern Africa

3.1 Internal QA

Algeria	Description
Group	7 groups that consist of 31 standards. Descriptions below have been translated from French.
Academic programmes	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Define academic programmes and how they are run. The aim is to design detailed academic programmes and provide the necessary tools for monitoring, developing and improving programmes. 2. Provide students with guidance throughout their education. This area is dedicated to providing students with complete assistance to orientate them and facilitate their integration into university life. 3. Evaluate and revise teaching. In order to keep teaching methods up to date, academic programmes need to be evaluated in order to improve pedagogical approaches. 4. Monitor students' knowledge and learning. Pedagogical committees and deliberation boards will measure the results of programmes. 5. Orientation and professional integration. The aim is to implement mechanisms that rely on cooperative relationships between the university and the socio-economic sector to facilitate the orientation and professional integration of graduates and ensure they maintain their employability. 6. Doctoral studies. The aim is to ensure and improve training for teachers and researchers by relying on national and international cooperation. 7. Continuing education (all throughout life). The aim is to implement and develop programmes that lead to awards of qualifications and/or certificates. The programmes are intended for graduates of an academic or socio-economic context and to measure the social role of the institution.
Research	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Organisation, structuring and development of research. The institution creates bodies in charge of developing research. 2. Scientific relationships and partners. The institution defines the terms and conditions for partnerships between the institution and its different partners. 3. Development of research. The institution implements mechanisms to promote the development of research.
Governance	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Information system. The aim is to equip the institution with a reliable and efficient information system. 2. Policy making conditions. Describe the institution's policy making tools. 3. Organisation and management of components and departments. Define the skills, responsibilities and missions of human resources and the material means they need. 4. Management of support functions for mission departments. Monitor the conformity of resources (human and material) with the institution's missions and values. 5. Quality procedures. Promote the implementation of quality procedures that are adapted to the institution's missions and values.
University life	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Provide welcoming services and assistance to students and staff. Ensure that all measures have been taken to welcome students and staff and to provide them with the necessary information. 2. Cultural and sports activities. Encourage the institution to offer cultural and sports activities to its community. 3. Living, working, and learning conditions for university actors (health, hygiene, safety, etc.). The aim is to offer a suitable environment that covers all needs to create a better standard of hygiene. 4. Societal responsibility (ethics, civil rights, equal opportunities, sustainable development, etc.). The aim is to create an environment that fosters productive relationships between the university and the socio-economic sector.
Infrastructures	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Administrative infrastructures. The aim is to determine whether the institution has specific infrastructures for administrative activities. 2. Pedagogical infrastructures. The aim is to determine whether the institution has specific infrastructures for pedagogical activities. 3. Scientific and research infrastructures. The aim is to determine whether the institution has specific infrastructures for scientific and research activities. 4. Housing and food infrastructures. The aim is to determine whether the institution has specific infrastructures for housing and food. 5. Cultural and sports infrastructures. The aim is to determine whether the institution has specific infrastructures for cultural and sports activities.

The HAQAA Initiative · Northern Africa

Algeria	Description
Relationships with Higher Education Institutions (HEIs)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Participation in the development of local authorities. The aim is to transform the institution into a major actor for local development. 2. Relationship with companies. The institution needs to ensure that academic programmes meet the actual requirements of economic actors and produce operational graduates. 3. Research and development. The aim is to make research a major element of the company-university relationship. <p>Teaching and monitoring. The institution needs to develop listening tools to satisfy the needs of socio-economic actors in terms of their areas of expertise and to anticipate their expectations.</p>
Cooperation	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. International openness policy. The institution needs to find the means that will allow it to open up on an international level. 2. Partnership and mobility. The aim is to specify the conditions for partnerships and mobility that are likely to favour international openness. 3. Knowledge exchange and pooling of resources. Specify the methods for exchanging knowledge and pooling resources.

Egypt	Description
Standard	12 standards with 89 indicators
Strategic planning	The HEI has clear and published mission and vision, that were defined by wide participation of stakeholders, and that reflect the institution's educational, research and community roles. The institution should also have a realistic strategic plan with defined objectives, and an implementation (action) plan, with defined time frame, budget, resources, responsibilities, and KPIs
Governance & leadership	<p>The institution has qualified academic and administrative leadership, that are selected/appointed based on objective declared, and transparent criteria. The institution works on continuous professional development of its current and potential future leaders, and objectively and transparently evaluate their performance</p> <p>The institution has a documented organizational structure appropriate to the size and nature of its activities and that supports the achievement of its mission.</p> <p>The institution has core values, and adheres to Integrity, credibility, transparency and professional ethics</p>
Quality management & Development	<p>The institution has a quality administration system that receives support (and commitment to quality) from the institution's leadership.</p> <p>The Institution performs self-evaluation in a wholistic and continuous manner, using internal and external reviews, and uses the results to enhance its performance</p>
Faculty members (Academic staff)	<p>The institution has adequate numbers of qualified faculty members (and assisting faculty members) that correspond to the requirements of its educational programs, and that support the achievement of its mission and objectives.</p> <p>The institution should build the capacity of its academic and teaching staff, objectively evaluates their performance, and periodically assess their satisfaction.</p>
Administrative body	<p>The institution has adequate numbers of qualified administrative and technical personnel (employees) that are appropriate to the size and nature of its activities, and that support the achievement of its mission and objectives.</p> <p>The institution should be keen on building the capacity of its administrative staff, objectively evaluates their performance, and periodically assess their satisfaction.</p>
Physical and Financial Resources	The institution has adequate financial and physical resources and supporting facilities that correspond to the size and nature of its activities, and that support the achievement of its mission and objectives. The institution uses its resources efficiently and works on their development.
Academic standards & Educational Programs	<p>The institution adopts the National Academic Reference Standards (NARS) or any other Academic Standards (Superior to the NARS) that correspond to its mission and objectives, and it should assure the alignment of the objectives of its programs with the adopted academic standards.</p> <p>The institution ensures the responsiveness of the programs it provides to community needs and labor market requirements, it should document the programs and courses specifications and periodically review and develop them with stakeholders' participation</p>
Teaching & learning	The institution has a documented strategy for teaching, learning and student assessment, that is periodically reviewed and developed, and that supports the achievement of the academic standards adopted by the institution.

The HAQAA Initiative · Northern Africa

Egypt	Description
	<p>The institution should ensure the appropriateness of teaching, learning and assessment methods to the intended learning outcomes (ILOs), and should promote self-learning, and provide its opportunities and resources.</p> <p>The institution should provide (in participation with community & industry) clinical & field training that enables student to acquire employability (including professional) skills, and it should periodically evaluate and develop these training programs.</p> <p>The institution should ensure objective & fair student assessment that supports learning, using assessment methods and tools that are appropriate to the assessed ILOs.</p>
Students & alumni	<p>The institution has fair, transparent and published rules and procedures for student enrolment, that are periodically reviewed and developed.</p> <p>The institution works on attracting foreign students and provide diverse forms of support and guidance to students, especially supporting the integration of students with special needs into the learning community.</p> <p>The institution encourages student activities, and is keen on engaging students, periodically assessing their feedback and involving them in decision making.</p> <p>The institution should have means to follow up alumni, actively communicate with them and provide opportunities for their continuous professional development</p>
Scientific research & other scholastic activities	<p>The institution has a research plan that is related to the University's plan and that is supported by adequate resources.</p> <p>The institution supports researchers, encourage international publications and facilitates research partnerships and inter/multi-disciplinary research projects</p> <p>The institution provides an academic environment that promotes and support various scholastic activities.</p>
Post graduate studies	<p>The institution provides a diversity of post graduate programs that respond to labor market and community needs and that help achieving the institution's mission and objectives.</p> <p>The institution adopts reference standards for the post graduate programs, document their descriptions and periodically review and develop them.</p> <p>The institution provides adequate learning resources for post graduate students and ensure fair, transparent and objective assessment of their learning and achievements.</p>
Community participation & environmental development	<p>The institution should be keen on assessing and responding to the needs and priorities of its community, and it should work on developing the environment.</p> <p>The institution ensures community participation in its various activities and decision making, and should periodically assess the satisfaction of the community with the services and activities it provides.</p>

ANQAHE	Description
Standard	Standards, collected from the eight Arab states. Only the common ones to all eight countries are listed. Altogether eleven common standards have been found.
Vision, mission & objectives	The institution's vision, mission and objectives define its identity, including its educational activities, student structure and role in the context of high education institutions. Any evaluative process usually emerges from the institution definition of its mission, vision and objectives; and it reflects to what extent the institution realized its mission and vision.
Governance & administration	Governance & Administration system contributes to the achievement of the institution's mission and objectives where those involved in the educational institution's governance, management and their employees are provides with the institution's objectives and order of their priorities in addition to developmental and organizational plans, which leads to supporting educational and learning environment therein. Governance Council (Deans) is in charge of quality and integration of the institution, achievement of its mission and objectives, managing financial affairs and developing and implementing its general policies. The Council is also responsible for following-up the academic and administrative affairs in various administrative units and faculties within the institution.
Educational programme	Educational programmes are defined as a set of educational programmes that enable the educational institution to achieve its mission and translate its objectives taking the principles of quality into consideration.
Faculty members	The institution must select, develop and retain qualified faculty members as they assume the responsibility of implementing and providing quality educational programs.
Students & students support services	The institution must support students' programs and student's guidance services to achieve its mission and objectives through contribution to knowledge and educational development of its students, where these programs and services are expected to cope with the philosophy of the institution. Thus, each institution is expected to provide basic support services for students regardless of level of programs it provides.
Financial resources	Financial planning and budget of the institution are among continuous activities that are realistic and must be based on the institution's mission and objectives.

The HAQAA Initiative · Northern Africa

ANQAHE	Description
Physical resources	Physical resources must be effectively designed, particularly in relation to teaching facilities and they must be retained and managed to facilitate the process of achievement of mission and objectives of the institution.
Research	Research is the scientific activity directed towards developing and/or modifying theories and developing applied knowledge.
Community service	No description.
Quality assurance management	The institution must develop a documentation system that contributes to implementing the principles of Total Quality management and seeking to improve the effectiveness of quality management system.
Institutional integrity	The institution must show a high degree of integrity and adherence to professional behavioural practices and transparency when submitting various reports whether they are presented to internal councils or the public concerning teaching status, scholarships, services, students, faculty members, employees and relationships with various stakeholders especially quality assurance authorities and higher education councils.

4. Eastern Africa

4.1 Internal QA

Ethiopia	Description
Standard	Ten standards for internal QA. No description of standards has been found online.
Vision, mission and educational goals	No description of standards has been found online.
Governance and management system	
Infrastructure and learning resources	
Academic and support staff	
Student admission and support services	
Program relevance and curriculum	
Teaching, learning and assessment	
Student progression and graduate outcomes	
Research and outreach activities	
Internal quality assurance	

Kenya	Description
Standard	Seven sets of standards: institutional standards, standards for physical resources, standards for academic programmes, standards for open, distance, and e-learning, standards for university libraries, standards for technical universities, and standards for specialised degree awarding institutions. The presented standards below are the institutional ones.
Vision, mission and philosophy	A university shall have vision & mission statements and philosophy which clearly and succinctly indicate its strategic direction.
Charter status	A Charter shall be the full accreditation status of any university in Kenya. Each university shall have a Charter as a legal instrument of accreditation that authorizes the institution to discharge its mandate.
Governance and management	A university shall clearly articulate its governance and management structures in line with the Act. A university shall ensure that there is clear separation of powers between the governing organs.
Human resources	A university shall have adequate and competent human resources to carry out its mandate in accordance to its human resource policy.
Academic programmes	A university shall offer programmes that are commensurate with its institutional accreditation status and that meet the standards of academic programmes.
Financial resources	A university shall have adequate financial resources to meet its obligations.
Planning	A university shall show evidence of long and medium term plans to ensure sustainability and continuous improvement.
Student services	A university shall provide student services that are commensurate with the student population.
Quality of teaching	A university shall promote highest standards of teaching and learning. A university shall institutionalize internal quality assurance mechanisms.
Research and innovation	A university shall show evidence of promoting quality research and innovation.
Community service	A university shall engage in community outreach that promote cultural and social life of the society.
Constituent colleges	A constituent college shall be established as a transitional status prior to Charter, under the mentorship of a chartered university. A constituent college shall have the same sponsorship as the mentoring university.
Campus	A university campus shall be the smallest unit of a university and shall have adequate resources to support its student's population which shall mirror those of the main university.
Open, distance and e-learning (ODEL) centres	A university may establish ODEL centres with teaching facilities for the purpose of bringing education closer to students.

The HAQAA Initiative · Eastern Africa

Kenya	Description
Students recruitment agency for foreign universities	A foreign university may have a local agency licensed under the regulations governing agencies for purposes of marketing and recruitment and not for teaching purposes.
Academic integrity standards	A university shall carry out its operations in line with and be guided by the national values and principles of governance as set out in Article 10 of the Constitution and as spelt out in the Universities Act No. 42, 2012.

Malawi	Description
Standard	Seven standards for internal quality assurance.
Policy and procedures for quality assurance	Institutions should have a policy and associated procedures for the assurance of the quality and standards of their programmes and awards. They should also commit themselves explicitly to the development of a culture which recognizes the importance of quality, and quality assurance, in their work. To achieve this, institutions should develop and implement a strategy for the continuous enhancement of quality. The policy, strategy, and procedures should have a formal status and be publicly available. They should also include a role for students and other stakeholders.
Approval, monitoring and periodic review of programmes and awards	Institutions should have formal mechanisms for the approval, periodic review, and monitoring of their programmes and awards.
Assessment of students	Students should be assessed using published criteria, regulations and procedures which are applied consistently.
Quality assurance of academic staff	Institutions should have ways of satisfying themselves that staff involved in teaching students are qualified and competent to do so. The staff and their competences are subject to those undertaking internal performance appraisal and external review.
Learning resources and student support	Institutions should ensure that the resources available for the support of student learning are adequate and appropriate for each programme offered. No programme should be introduced if minimum learning resources and student support structures are not in place.
Information systems	Institutions should ensure that they collect, analyse, and make use of relevant information for the effective management of their programmes of study and other activities.
Public information	Institutions should regularly publish up-to-date, impartial, and objective information, both quantitative and qualitative, about the programmes and awards they are offering.

Mauritius	Description
Criteria	18 criteria for academic audit.
Institutional mission, aims and objectives	Institution's mission is explicit. It is understood and owned by its staff. Aims and objectives are in keeping with the mission. They are realistic and achievable.
Institutional approach to quality assurance	The institution has adopted a working definition of quality assurance which is compatible with its mission. A systematic and comprehensive approach to quality assurance affecting all the essential services of the institution is being implemented. A quality assurance handbook addressing all the affected activities is in evidence. The quality assurance handbook is available to all departments for consultation by all staff members.
Governance	(1) Principles of good governance are evident and they are translated into: working in an open manner so as to facilitate access to its policies and decisions by the public, encouraging institution, wide participation in the formulation of policies, ensuring that specific responsibilities are clear and are assumed appropriately by members according to their hierarchy, timely implementation of policies and monitoring thereof, governing body being cohesive in its approach. (2) Top management leadership is demonstrable through: developing and communicating the institution's strategic plan with identifiable short term and long term goals and objectives, developing and communicating the institution's mission and plan, establishing effective links with external stakeholders, developing an organisational structure which reduces bureaucracy and improves communication, efficiency and effectiveness. (3) Management of funds through: Transparency and accountability, proper budgeting and rationalisation of funds with justification, taking into account short term and long term goals, ensuring cost effectiveness of programmes, effective internal auditing. (4) Management of academic activities through: ensuring that programmes are relevant, ensuring that academic standards are continuously monitored and improved, ensuring that the institution's awards are recognised nationally, regionally and internationally. (5) Admissions: Policies regarding admissions are clear, transparent and accessible by the public policy on equal opportunities is implemented consideration is given to physically disabled and mature students. (6) Students Council: A body such as a Students

The HAQAA Initiative · Eastern Africa

Mauritius	Description
	<p>Council is operational to represent students in various committees, including the Academic Board. The Council's voice is heeded by management and appropriate action taken. (7) Students Welfare: An office for students' welfare is operational and it is actively supported by management. There is evidence that students are encouraged to use the services provided. Staff Council: A body fitting the description of staff council is active with full participation of staff. It caters for the needs of all the institution's staff, ensuring that their rights are respected. It positively contributes to the effective management of the institution. (8) Staff Welfare: Provision is made to have an office or an association to provide support to staff. It takes an active role in ensuring that staff are listened to and their needs are acted upon in the most appropriate manner. (9) Staff Appointments, Appraisal and Promotion: The institution has well established policies for appointment, appraisal and promotion of staff and that these policies are effectively implemented. These policies are reviewed to reflect changing circumstances. (10) Staff Development: Performance appraisal is undertaken periodically in a transparent manner with the employment of clearly developed policies. Staff are informed of management's recorded perception of their strengths and weaknesses. Appropriate support and training is given to staff concerned to enable them to overcome weaknesses so as to perform more effectively. Opportunities are given to deserving members to further their career. Continuing professional development is actively promoted.</p>
Curricula and programmes - aims and objectives	<p>Curricula aims and objectives are explicit and known to staff and students. Specialist aims and objectives are consistent with institutional mission and aims. Aims and objectives correspond to the needs of students, society and the economy, as revealed by systematic investigation. Curricula accurately reflect declared aims and objectives and the needs identified. Curricula provide an appropriate balance of specialist content, general conceptual skills and personal, transferable skills. Curricula are up-to-date in terms of specialist developments and current thinking on curriculum development and delivery.</p>
Programme design, validation, approval and review	<p>Programmes are designed to meet the needs of students, taking into account programme length/duration, modes of attendance, location, structure and sequence, optional elements etc. Provision is made to enable students who do not have traditional academic qualifications, but who have the motivation and potential, including accreditation of prior learning (APL), accreditation of experiential learning (APEL), credit accumulation and transfer (CAT) work-based learning (WBL) and those who are mature to enrol on these programmes. Programmes go through a validation process and are subsequently approved by the academic council/senate prior to their offer. The validation process is an established procedure which is thorough, consistent, reliable and is in conformity with international norms. Programmes are periodically reviewed to assess their suitability. There is an established system of regular liaison between the institution and industry, public agencies, professional bodies and other potential end-users.</p>
The teaching and learning environment	<p>The academic environment, physical and social, is generally conducive to learning, and the level of research and other scholarly activities is appropriate to the level of teaching. Teaching accommodation is sufficient in quantity and is appropriate for the curricula on offer and for the full range of students. There are adequate specialist facilities including practical and experimental learning facilities for the curricula on offer. Ancillary facilities staff accommodation, storage space, preparation rooms, amenity accommodation etc. are adequate. The physical environment is adequately maintained in terms of safety, cleanliness, repairs and decor. Accommodation, especially specialist accommodation, is optimally used as evidenced by suitable plans, schedules, timetables and control systems.</p>
Staff resources ancillary	<p>The teaching staff establishment is sufficient to deliver the curricula. The teaching staff complement is suitable for the curricula, in terms of the mix of qualifications and skills, experience, aptitudes, age, status etc. There is adequate support in terms of library, technician, administrative, student services, staffing, etc. Staff resources are effectively deployed: roles and relationships are well defined and understood; duties allocated are appropriate to qualifications, experience and aptitude; there is provision for review, consultation and redeployment. Staff development needs are systematically identified, in relation to individual aspirations, the curricula and institutional requirements. All staff, academic and non-academic, are given the opportunity with necessary support to undertake appropriate staff development related to identified needs: induction, in-service training, secondments, consultancy, research and other scholarly activities.</p>
Learning resources	<p>There are sufficient physical resources to deliver the curricula, including equipment, materials and Information and Communications Technology. Equipment is up-to-date, readily available and effectively deployed. Library, audio-visual, internet access, appropriate software and hardware and other academic services are adequate for the curricula.</p>
Programme organisation and delivery	<p>Learning programmes are effectively organised and managed. Teaching programmes are clearly articulated, made known to students and regularly monitored. Coursework and assessment are systematically scheduled. Feedback is regularly obtained from</p>

The HAQAA Initiative · Eastern Africa

Mauritius	Description
	students, employers, moderators and auditors, and analysed and acted upon as appropriate.
Teaching and learning	<p>Teaching and learning are based on explicit learning outcomes which are consistent with programme/course aims. Teaching methods are innovative, varied, and appropriate to the stated learning outcomes and make effective use of available facilities, equipment, materials and aids. Teaching is well planned and prepared and effectively performed, taking account of the needs of all categories of students. The style and pace of teaching and learning takes due account of the nature of the curricula, students' varied abilities and prior learning, and the specific needs of the very able or weak students equally. Teaching approaches encourage independent learning with critical thinking and students take responsibility for their own learning. Learning is enriched by appropriate reference to cross-curricular links, current research, industrial applications and development of generic skills such as communication and teamwork.</p>
Student support	<p>Students' needs for guidance and support are recognised and provision made for advice and assistance in the curricular, vocational and personal domains. Responsibility for particular aspects of student support is clearly located and effective liaison maintained between arrangements at all levels. Adequate provision is made for information and advice to potential students during the application and enrolment phases. Students are effectively supported during their studies by systems of induction, course tutors, personal tutors and provision for remediation and curricular choice. Students are adequately prepared for the next stage of study or employment by appropriate contacts, information, advice and training.</p>
Monitoring and assessment	<p>A range of assessment methods including coursework, projects, research and examinations etc. is used in a planned manner to serve diagnostic, formative and summative purposes. Assessment schemes are compatible with the aims and aspects of the curricula as taught. The scope and weighting of assessment schemes are clear and known to all concerned and the standards applied are explicit and consistent across the curricula. Procedures are regularly applied to ensure that, as far as possible, assessment schemes are valid, reliable and fairly administered. Coursework is regularly set and assessed and is at the appropriate level of attainment. Coursework faithfully reflects the full range of curricular aims, including the development of generic skills. Student achievement, as represented by their coursework, is comparable with that of students on similar courses elsewhere. Students' performance and attitudes indicate a positive and successful learning experience. A systematic procedure for keeping record of student progress, for providing feedback to students and taking corrective action where necessary is effectively employed. Students have ready access to reasonable appeal procedures.</p>
Output, outcomes and quality control	<p>Performance indicators are regularly used to inform institutional assessment of achievement in relation to educational aims and learning outcomes. Results are monitored and analysed and appropriate action taken. Results against these or other appropriate indicators compare favourably with institutional or national norms. Quality Control arrangements at institutional, department, subject and/or course level are consistent and coherent. Quality standards, policies and strategies, are consistently applied and periodically reviewed within the cognate area. There is a general commitment to excellence in teaching and learning, apparent in staff and student attitudes in all aspects of provision.</p>
External examiners	<p>External examiners, as implied, are independent of the institution and are appointed for a specified period not exceeding three years. They are from reputable institutions and have the necessary expertise and experience. Terms of reference are explicit and should include moderation of question papers and model answers, moderation of scripts and providing feedback on performance of students. A feedback on the curriculum should be included. Ethical practice is given due importance.</p>
Research degree students	<p>Students are clearly informed of their commitment to research through appropriate guidelines. Role of supervisors is explicit and expectations by students from them and vice versa are clearly understood. Students receive adequate support through regular tutorials and continuous monitoring of progress, together with feedback. Physical resources including appropriate equipment are readily available.</p>
Collaborative provisions	<p>The collaboration is legally binding through a memorandum of understanding. Collaborating institutions undertake the responsibility to ensure that programmes are of the required standard and are offered with the same rigour as those in the parent institution. Students benefit from the same standard of resources as the regular students of the awarding institution. The awarding institution undertakes the responsibility to assure the quality of the educational provision under the collaboration. The partner institution is subject to quality audit or quality assessment together with the parent institution. Students are fully informed of the nature of the collaboration between the institutions concerned.</p>

The HAQAA Initiative · Eastern Africa

Mauritius	Description
Industrial links/work-based experience	A committee comprising the institution and industry and other principal stakeholders meets regularly for the purposes of manpower planning. An active interface exists with industries for the purposes of identifying programmes of study and suitable work experience compatible with the students' programme. The industrial sector is encouraged to participate in curriculum design and validation.
Community service and good citizenship	The institution plays an active role in inculcating the spirit of a healthy community and in providing its services and expertise to it to promote psycho-socio-economic integration and development.

Mozambique	Description
Indicator	Nine indicators, split into 36 standards, as described below. This table has been translated from Portuguese.
Mission and general objectives of the organizational unit (OU)	The OU mission should be clearly expressed, relevant, disclosed and related to the institutional development strategies and socio-economic sector of the country. General objectives of the OU should be clearly defined, relevant, articulated with the OU mission and emphasize the needs of the professional sector it serves.
Organization and management of quality assurance mechanisms	The OU must define the curriculum model, teaching methods (published) and ensure a participatory and transparent management of courses and / or programs. The OU must have the resources necessary to meet the requirements of the teaching-learning processes, scientific research and related activities of the course and / or program and guarantee system of academic and administrative quality. The OU must possess, disseminate and implement national policies to promote equality and gender equity and diversity in relation to the course and / or program. The OU must have descriptions of the tasks / roles and responsibilities of the management staff, teaching and technical-administrative course and / or program. The OU should have training plans and performance evaluation system of academic staff assigned to the course and / or program. The course and / or program must have mechanisms and management and quality assurance procedures, including sharing of the self-assessment results.
Curriculum	The curriculum must have a clear and legally established structure, according to the Curriculum Framework of the institution and recognized by relevant authorities. The curriculum content should be relevant and ensure the development of skills in the areas of scientific research and extension and professional practices, and should be adjusted to the demands of society. The teaching and learning methods and student assessment should be consistent and coherent with the adopted curriculum model and the course learning objectives and / or of the program and should be student-centred. The student assessment system implemented in the course and / or program should be widely known, consistent and fair. The course and / or program must have national and international partnerships in the implementation of the course curriculum and / or program.
Faculty course	The course and / or program must have qualified staff in sufficient numbers in order to function effectively. The OU must have experienced, full-time, and qualified teachers, with psycho-pedagogical training to function effectively. The OU must have and implement a recruitment policy as well as the selection and progression procedures for careers in teaching, research and extension.
Student body	The OU should ensure the availability of information on available student places and the distribution of student body. The OU must implement policies that respect equal opportunities, gender balance and have clear criteria and admission procedures. The OU must have a registration system archive of students. The OU must disclose the admission requirements for the course and / or program. The course and / or program must have structures and support measures, counselling and monitoring procedures of students. The OU should ensure the participation of students in quality assurance processes and improvement actions, including the participation of student associations.
Research and outreach	The OU must have and implement the policies and perform the research with the participation of all members of the OU, as well as ensure the publication of research results. The OU must have sufficient financial, logistical, and human resources for research and outreach activities. The OU should have policies to provide services, community outreach activities in areas relevant to the course and / or program, and ensure the participation of students in these activities.
Infrastructure - laboratories, classrooms, libraries and equipment	The OU must have adequate infrastructure for its number of teachers, students and administrative staff. The OU must have equipment and support services for the course and / or program to work effectively. The OU must have comfortable and well equipped classrooms. The OU must have laboratories equipped for practical research. Libraries must be properly

The HAQAA Initiative · Eastern Africa

Mozambique	Description
	equipped and organized. The OU should have appropriate and clean bathrooms for the use of teachers, students and administrative staff.
Administrative staff	The OU should have a sufficient number of administrative staff for course and / or program to function effectively. The OU should have a qualified and experienced administrative staff to function effectively. The OU should have policies and implement recruitment procedures, selection, training, performance management and career progression for administrative staff. The OU should ensure that the rights and rules in regards to hygiene and safety conditions are respected for the administrative staff.
Internationalisation	The OU must have and implement policies to promote the mobility of teachers, researchers and students of the course and / or program.

Zambia	Description
Requirement	Ten requirements for the internal QA (first seven are the core ones and the last three ones are non-core requirements)
Governance and Management (core, 10 %)	A governance system, which reflects its mission and strategy. A governing board with defined roles and responsibilities. A clearly defined management structure. An effective system of leadership staffed by qualified administrators.
Academic Programmes (core, 20 %)	Academic programmes are systematically designed. A clear definition of all programmes: Undergraduate, Post Graduate and Research, and Distance Learning. A clear organisation of Faculties and/or Directorates.
Student Admission and Learner support (core, 15 %)	An admission policy on the selection of students. An academic calendar. A support systems for learners, such as accommodation, bookshops, internet services, etc. A system for verification of students enrolled at the institution.
Staff (core, 15 %)	A policy on staff recruitment and staff development. Proven sufficient numbers of qualified full-time staff to support academic and support operations. Supply of academic support staff and assistants for carrying out academic programmes, Conditions of service for all staff.
Physical Infrastructure (core, 15 %)	Physical facilities in sufficient quantity and quality to ensure learning and teaching. Quantity and quality of physical infrastructure for support services, such as catering, bookstores, etc. Quantity and quality of technology support for teaching and learning. Quantity and quality of technology systems to support management and operational functions.
Financial Resources (core, 15 %)	Financial resources to support operations. Accounting systems are in line with accepted accounting standards. A risk assessment policy and external auditing.
Health and safety (core, 10 %)	Compliance with the prescribed minimum requirements of health and safety and conforms to the building regulations under the relevant written law. Provision for the safety and security of students and staff.
Vision, Mission and Strategy (non-core, 40 %)	A Vision Statement which has been formally adopted. A Mission Statement which reflects the character of the Institution. A Strategy which indicates short, medium, and long term objectives.
Research (non-core, 35 %)	Research Policy and Strategy. Facilities and equipment to support the research strategy. Mechanisms to ensure compliance with ethical standards.
Technological Infrastructure (non-core, 25 %)	Facilities and platforms for e-learning. Access to the internet for students and staff. Management Information Systems.

Zimbabwe	Description
Standard	15 standards for internal quality assurance.
Strategic statements of the institution	This standard shall seek to ensure that each institution has statements that clearly state its mandate, core-values, mission, vision, goals and objectives.
Governance and leadership	(1) Governance of Higher Education Institution (HEI) - This standard specifies requirements for HEI's systems of governance, paying particular attention to the calibre of the leadership and issues of autonomy to fulfil the institution mandate. (2) Leadership - This standard specifies the leadership requirements for an HEI in terms of qualifications, competencies and

The HAQAA Initiative · Eastern Africa

Zimbabwe	Description
	experience. (3) Council/Board – This standard specifies the composition of the supreme administrative board. (4) Senate – This standard specifies the requirements of the highest academic decision making board. (5) Faculty/School – This standard specifies the requirements of the Faculty/School or Directorate (whichever nomenclature the HEI chooses to use).
Planning	This standard seeks to ensure that the institution engages in ongoing participatory planning that provides direction for the institution and leads to the achievement of the intended outcomes of its programmes and services while also providing resources for the fulfilment of its mission.
Infrastructure, ICT & library resources	This standard seeks to ensure that the institution provides sufficient and appropriate infrastructure, information and communication technology resources, library and information resources sufficient to support its teaching, learning, research and innovation and administrative needs. (1) Infrastructure - The infrastructure shall meet the minimum standards of the current by-laws and safety of structures and fittings regulations. (2) ICT resources - The institution shall provide sufficient and appropriate technology to support its academic administrative systems for the purpose of teaching, learning, research and innovation. (3) Library & Information resources - The institution shall provide library and information resources with an appropriate level of recency, depth and breadth to support its active teaching, learning, research and administrative needs.
Research, consultancy and extension services	This standard sets out the expected characteristics and scope for research, consultancy and extension services.
Integrity	This standard specifies the requirements for the probity of the HEIs across the board.
Institutional self-assessment and self-evaluation	The institution shall develop and implement an (on going) self-assessment process that evaluates its overall effectiveness in achieving its mission and goals and its compliance with accreditation standards.
Student admissions and retention	The institution shall admit students from diverse backgrounds based on merit and retain them through meeting students' learning outcomes.
Student support and development services	The institution shall provide student support and development services which enable holistic student development and create a conducive learning environment.
Professional staff	The standard specifies that the HEI's Institutional, research and service programmes shall be developed, administered and monitored by qualified professionals.
Mode of delivery	In order to achieve educational outcomes, institutions shall ensure that adequate resources are available for effective transmission of knowledge and understanding through various modes of delivery namely: Face to face; on-line; and Open Distance Learning - ODL (Block release, visiting schools, e-learning and blended models).
Assessment of student learning	The institution shall have systematic and broad-based assessment criteria which shall be applied consistently to assess the student performance. Assessments shall be based on published criteria, clear statements, regulations and procedures of what students are expected to gain, achieve, demonstrate or know by the time they complete their academic programme.
Academic programmes	This standard ensures that all academic programmes are aligned with the institution's mandate. The institution offers high quality programmes that refer to the Mission, Vision and Goals. The programmes shall articulate knowledge, skills and competencies that students shall acquire through utilisation of delivery systems and modes of instruction compatible with the objectives of the curriculum and appropriate to the current and future needs of the student.
General education	General education addresses the requisite knowledge and competences that every student graduating from the institution possesses. The competencies address both the mandate and mission of the institution.
Programme design and administration	The institution establishes and adheres to clear policies and procedures for designing, reviewing and improving courses and programmes.

Tanzania	A series of minimum norms and guidelines for governance units, for employment, staff performance review and career development, for the harmonisation of awards offered in Tanzania, for postgraduate training, and for credit accumulation and transfer.
Norm	No definition or description of these norms has been found.

IUCEA	Description
Principle	A comprehensive document of five chapters: regionalisation of QA, rationale for the regional principles and guidelines in QA, principles and guidelines, QA decisions, and implementation of principles and guidelines. Third chapter presents the below presented principles for internal QA.
Governance and management	Higher education institutions shall be governed and managed through good governance practices, in line with the legal frameworks for their establishment.
Institutionalization of quality assurance	Institutionalized quality assurance structures, systems and processes shall be established to support, monitor and evaluate quality enhancement in higher education institutions.
Learning environment	Higher education institutions shall provide an environment conducive to learning.
Student support services	Higher education institutions shall provide adequate and appropriate resources to support student learning.
Students with special needs	Higher education institutions shall provide support mechanisms to students with special needs.
Programme development, implementation and review	Programme development, implementation and reviews shall be carried out using institutionally and nationally prescribed guidelines and procedures.
Criteria for admission of students and granting of awards of qualifications	Higher education institutions shall have clear and transparent mechanisms for admission into programmes and award of degrees.
Quality of staff	Higher education institutions shall provide adequate number and qualified staff for the support of teaching, research and community service.
Management of information	Higher education institutions shall put in place up to date and retrievable information management systems which facilitates data collection, storage and access
Research and innovation	Research and innovation shall be considered as important factors in the development and enhancement of institution's quality assurance activities.

4.2 External QA

Ethiopia	Description
Principle	Four principles for external quality assurance
Academic freedom and integrity	HERQA conducts its day-to-day activities in such a way as to promote academic freedom and intellectual and institutional integrity in education and training in HEIs. HERQA embraces the belief that Education and Training Institutions (ETIs) have prime responsibility for Quality Assurance. It is also the ETIs responsibility to respect institutional integrity. All help HERQA renders or aspires to render to these institutions is attuned to this basic principle.
Independence of evaluation	Effort will be made to ensure the independence of the individual evaluators, including the adoption of a clear policy on real or potential conflicts of interest. Quality audits (institutional or program level), accreditations and other assessments carried out by the Agency should be undertaken in the context of criteria and procedures that are published in advance of any review. The formulation of such criteria and procedures should include consultation with major stakeholders. Quality audits (institutional or program level), accreditations and other assessments should be carried out in a spirit of independence, and judgments made as part of the review should not be subject to external influences whether from governments, institutions or elsewhere.
Accountability	Decisions made by HERQA should be based on clear and published criteria and should be reached after the application of transparent processes and procedures. HERQA should be publicly accountable. HERQA is subject to regular quality review that contains a significant external element.
Conduct, confidentiality and disclosure	HERQA as per Higher Education Institution Proclamation 650/2009 and relevant legal documents of the Ministry of Education and of the Agency may organize committees on ad hoc or permanent basis to review an educational institution. The committees conduct their business in transparent manner, but without undermining the integrity of the review throughout the process; The education institution should be given as much information as possible about the Review Committee's thinking to enable it to respond to issues effectively. Any potential conflicts of interest will be declared before or at the first meeting if a member of the Committee is in the

The HAQAA Initiative · Eastern Africa

Ethiopia	Description
	same institution as the institution under review. If the Committee invites views from any bodies or individuals about the institution under review, the institution should be able to see those comments in the interests of transparency and fairness. This should be made clear to any such individuals or bodies. Each review will include at least one visit by the Review Committee to the institution concerned. The review committee's deliberations during the review process are confidential and should not be disclosed to anyone else. The review committee will produce a report summarizing its activities and findings and highlighting teaching and learning innovations and good practice, together with its recommendations and commendations.

Malawi	Description
Standard	Eight standards for external quality assurance.
Use of internal quality assurance procedures	External quality assurance procedures should take into account the effectiveness of the internal quality assurance processes described in Standards for Accreditation of Higher Education Institutions in Malawi.
Development of external quality assurance processes	The aims and objectives of quality assurance processes should be determined before the processes themselves are developed, by all those responsible, and should be published with a description of the procedures to be used.
Criteria for decisions	Any formal decisions made as a result of an external quality assurance activity should be based on explicit published criteria that are applied consistently.
Processes fit for purpose	All external quality assurance processes should be designed specifically to ensure their fitness to achieve the aims and objectives set for them.
Reporting	External evaluation reports should be published and written in a style which is clear and readily accessible to their intended readership. Any decisions or recommendations contained in reports should be easy for a reader to find.
Follow-up procedures	External quality assurance processes which lead to recommendations for action should have a predetermined follow-up procedure which is implemented consistently.
Periodic reviews	External quality assurance of institutions and/or programmes should be undertaken on a cyclical basis. The length of the cycle and the review procedures to be used should be clearly defined and published in advance. Normally the length of the cycle should be the length of the duration of the programme, but this should not exceed five years.
System-wide analyses	Quality assurance agencies should produce annual summary reports describing and analysing the general findings of their reviews, evaluations and assessments.

IUCEA	Description
Principle	Page 12 of the provided source reads: The external principles and guidelines, "focused on the national commissions/councils, are intended to harmonize external quality assurance practices in the Community. They cover standards, guidelines and processes for external quality assurance, quality assurance activities, documentation and dissemination of information, monitoring and evaluation, and coherence of national and regional policies and practices." (see Annex I)
Standards, guidelines and processes for external quality assurance	National commissions and councils for higher education shall develop standards, guidelines and procedures for external quality assurance in line with their mandates.
Quality assurance activities	National commissions and councils for higher education shall regularly undertake external quality assurance evaluations of Higher Education Institutions geared towards promoting public confidence in the institutions and the quality of education provided.
Documentation and dissemination of information	National commissions and councils for higher education shall regularly document and disseminate information on the public aspects of quality assurance in higher education in the respective Partner States.
Monitoring and evaluation	National commissions and councils for higher education shall regularly monitor and evaluate progress in meeting their mandate as external quality assurance agencies.
Coherence of national and regional policies and practices	National commissions and councils for higher education shall ensure that there is coherence between national and institutional policies and practices with those of other EAC Partner States.

4.3 Standards and guidelines for internal QA for Open and Distance Learning

Kenya	Description
Standard	Standards, provided below, are in the source document divided into six separate components: university/provider's commitment, curriculum and instruction, staff support, student support, evaluation and assessment, advertising.
Needs assessment	The provider shall show evidence that an elaborate needs assessment or feasibility study has been undertaken giving the rationale or justification for setting up the institution or starting the programme as reflected in the philosophy of the provider.
Vision and mission statements of the institution/provider	A provider of open and distance learning shall have clearly stated vision and mission consistent with its philosophy and make it known to its constituents.
Objectives and strategies of the provider	The provider shall have clearly stated objectives and strategies for achieving its mission.
Governance and administration	The provider shall ensure that there is clear governance and administrative structures and involves stakeholders where appropriate.
Provider's network	Regional centres: The provider of open and distance learning (ODL) shall establish regional centres to bring services closer to the learners. Study centres: The provider shall make available study centres to bring basic services and facilities closer to the learners.
Collaborative arrangements	Providers may get into collaborative arrangements for delivery of open and distance education.
Mode of delivery	The provider shall specify the media that are to be used for basic delivery of the programmes well as support to the learners.
Preparation of course materials	For each media in use the provider shall have in place a clear process of preparation of course materials and orientation to ensure quality material "fit for purpose".
Curriculum development	The provider shall ensure that each programme of study results in collegiate level learning outcomes appropriate to the rigour and breadth of the degree or certificate to be awarded, and that the programme meets the general education requirements.
Instructional level and staff	The provider shall have a policy that ensures recruitment of academically and professionally qualified staff to administer and manage the programme.
Self-learning materials (CLMs)	The provider shall ensure availability of self-learning materials to suit learners' characteristics, the media used in the teaching-learning system and their separation from the tutors/instructor.
Pre-testing or piloting learning materials	The provider shall have in place mechanisms for pre-testing or piloting the learning materials to establish that they are at the learner's level and that the learners will use them without difficulties, and finally be able to achieve the objectives or intended learning outcomes.
Review of curriculum and learning materials	The provider shall put in place a mechanism for regular review of both the curriculum and learning materials by peers and experts.
Orientation and training on development of learning materials	The provider shall ensure appropriate orientation and training on requirements, skills and strategies of developing materials for open and distance learning by use of facilitators and training manuals.
Orientation to course tutors	The provider shall ensure appropriate orientation to course tutors or lecturers and counsellors by expert trainers on ODL system, who give face-face or non-contiguous intervention or interaction with the students.
Orientation to non-academic staff	The provider shall ensure appropriate orientation of non-academic staff.
Student services	The provider shall facilitate orientation for learners to prepare them to undertake ODL programmes.
Residential sessions	The provider shall organize residential sessions for learners for effective administration of the ODL programmes.
Admission into the programmes	The provider shall ensure that open and distance learning increases access and equity.
Duration and structures of academic programmes	The provider shall ensure that there is flexibility in the programme structures and durations.
Examination regulations	(1) The provider shall, at enrolment, inform the learner of any examinations that would be offered by external bodies and declare the requirements of the said examinations. (2) The provider shall have written examination regulations that will be brought to the attention of the learner during admission.
Assessment procedure	The provider shall put in place appropriate assessment procedures that will ensure proper assessment of the learner's ability and achievement and communication of results to the learners.

The HAQAA Initiative · Eastern Africa

Kenya	Description
Student evaluation	The provider shall ensure that evaluation and assessment of students meet the objectives and learning outcomes of the curriculum and objectives of the learners and the world of work.
Course evaluation	The provider shall ensure regular evaluation and review of programmes and courses (say once in five years) with a view to redesigning the programmes/courses for relevance and worth.
Evaluation of learners support services	The provider shall ensure that learners support services are constantly assessed for effectiveness of mode and medium of delivery.
Evaluation of staff	The provider shall put in place mechanisms for evaluation of both full-time and part-time staff to establish their performance and effectiveness.
Advertising and communication	(1) The provider and its agents shall ensure that advertising of programmes/courses is done in a fair and ethical manner following acceptable best practices, and comply with all relevant legislation. (2) Prior to admitting students, the University shall ensure that students are fully informed of the issues that affect them with respect to the management of the programme.

Rwanda	Description
Standard	List of standards, as provided below.
Needs assessment	The provider shall show evidence that an elaborate needs assessment or feasibility study has been undertaken giving the rationale or justification for setting up the institution or starting the programme as reflected in the philosophy of the provider.
Vision and mission statements of the provider	A provider of open and distance learning shall have clearly stated vision and mission consistent with its philosophy and make it known to its constituents.
Objectives and strategies of the provider	The provider shall have clearly stated objectives and strategies for achieving their mission.
Governance and administration	The provider shall ensure that there is clear governance and administrative structures and involve stakeholders where appropriate.
Regional centres	The provider of open and distance learning (ODL) shall establish regional centres to bring services closer to the learners.
Study centres	The provider shall make available study centres to bring basic services and facilities closer to learners.
Collaborative arrangements	The providers may get into collaborative arrangements for delivery of open and distance education.
Mode of delivery	The provider shall specify the media that are to be used for basic delivery as well as support to the learners.
Preparation of course materials	For each media in use the provider shall have in place a clear process of preparation of course materials and orientation to ensure quality material "fit for purpose".
Curriculum development	The provider shall ensure that each programme of study results in collegiate level learning outcomes appropriate to rigour and breadth of the degree or certificate to be awarded, and that the programme meets the general education requirements.
Instruction level and staff	The provider shall have a policy that ensures recruitment of academically and professionally qualified staff to administer and manage the programme.
Self-learning materials	The provider shall ensure availability of self-learning materials to suit learners' characteristics, the media used in teaching-learning system and their separation from the tutors/instructor.
Pre-testing or piloting learning materials	The provider shall have in place mechanisms for pre-testing or piloting the learning materials to establish that they are at the learner's level and that the learners will them without difficulties, and finally be able to achieve the objectives or intended learning outcomes.
Review of curriculum and learning materials	The provider shall put in place a mechanism for regular review of both the curriculum and instructional materials by peers and experts.
Orientation and training on development of learning materials	The provider shall ensure appropriate orientation and training on requirements, skills and strategies of developing materials for open and distance learning by use of facilitators and training manuals.
Orientation to course tutors	The provider shall ensure appropriate orientation to course tutors or lecturers and councillors by expert trainers in ODL system who give face-to-face or non-contiguous intervention or interaction with students.
Orientation to non-academic staff	The provider shall ensure appropriate orientation of non-academic staff.
Student services	The provider shall facilitate orientation for learners to prepare them to undertake ODL programmes.
Residential sessions	The provider shall organize residential sessions for learners for effective administration of the ODL programmes.

Rwanda	Description
Admission into the programmes	The provider shall ensure that open and distance learning increases access and equity.
Duration and structures of academic programmes	The provider shall ensure that there is flexibility in the programme structures and duration.
Examination regulations	The provider shall, at enrolment, inform the learner of any examinations that would be offered by external bodies and declare the requirements of the said examinations. The provider shall have written examination regulations that will be brought to the attention of the learner during admission.
Assessment procedure	The provider shall put in place appropriate assessment procedures that will ensure proper assessment of the learner's ability and achievement and communication of the results to the learners.
Student evaluation	The provider shall ensure that evaluation and assessment of students meet the objectives and learning outcomes of the curriculum and objectives of the learners and the world of work.
Course evaluation	The provider shall ensure regular (say once in five years) evaluation and review of programmes and courses with a view to redesigning the programmes/courses for relevance and worth.
Evaluation of learners support services	The provider shall ensure that learners support services are constantly assessed for effectiveness of the mode and medium of delivery.
Evaluation of staff	The provider shall put in place mechanisms for evaluation of both full-time and part-time staff to establish their performance and effectiveness.
Advertising	The provider and its agents shall ensure that advertising of programmes/courses is done in a fair and ethical manner following acceptable best practices, and comply with all relevant legislation.

4.4 QA of quality assurance agencies

Malawi	Description
Standard	Eight standards for quality assurance of quality assurance agencies
Use of external quality assurance procedures for higher education	The external quality assurance of agencies should take into account the external quality assurance processes described in Part 2.
Official status	External quality assurance agencies, whether local or international, should be formally recognized by competent public authorities in Malawi and have an established legal basis. They should comply with any requirements of legislative jurisdictions in Malawi.
Activities	Agencies should undertake external quality assurance activities at institutional and/or programme level on a regular basis.
Resources	Agencies should have adequate human and financial resources to enable them to organize and run their external quality assurance process(es) effectively and efficiently.
Mission statement	Agencies should have clear and explicit goals and objectives for their work, contained in a publicly available mission statement.
Independence	Agencies should be independent to the extent both that they have autonomous responsibility for their operations and that the conclusions and recommendations made in their reports cannot be influenced by third parties such as higher education institutions, ministries or other stakeholders.
External quality assurance criteria and processes used by the agencies	The processes, criteria and procedures used by agencies should be pre-defined and publicly available. These processes will normally be expected to include: (a) A self-assessment or equivalent procedure by the subject of the quality assurance process. (b) An external assessment by a group of experts, including e.g. student members and site visits, as decided by the agency. (c) Publication of a report, including any decisions, recommendations or other formal outcomes. (d) A follow-up procedure to review actions taken by the subject of the quality assurance process in the light of any recommendations contained in the report.
Accountability procedures	Agencies should have in place procedures for their own accountability.

5. Southern Africa

5.1 Internal QA

South Africa	Description
Criterion	19 HEQC criteria for institutional audits, covering two broad areas: Mission of the institution, links between planning, resource allocation and quality management; and teaching and learning, research and community engagement. Benchmarking, user surveys and impact studies apply to both broad areas
Fitness of purpose of institutional mission, goals and objectives in response to local, national and international context (including transformation issues)	The institution has a clearly stated mission and purpose with goals and priorities which are responsive to its local, national and international context and which provide for transformational issues. There are effective strategies in place for the realisation and monitoring of these goals and priorities. Human, financial and infrastructural resources are available to give effect to these goals and priorities.
Links between planning, resource allocation and quality management	Objectives and mechanisms for quality management are integrated into institutional planning. Financial planning ensures adequate resource allocation for the development, improvement and monitoring of quality in the core activities of teaching and learning, research and community engagement.
Management of the quality of teaching and learning	The arrangements for the quality assurance of and support for teaching and learning enhance quality and allow for its continuous monitoring.
Academic support services	Academic support services (e.g. library and learning materials, computer support services, etc.) adequately support teaching and learning needs, and help give effect to teaching and learning objectives.
Short courses, exported and partnership programmes, programmes offered at tuition centres and satellite campuses	The institution has effective systems in place for the quality management of short courses, exported and partnership programmes, and programmes offered at tuition centres and satellite campuses.
Certification	Clear and efficient arrangements ensure the integrity of learner records and certification processes. Oversight and monitoring responsibility is clearly allocated and acted upon.
Programme management	The administration of academic programmes is conducted within the framework of an effective programme management system. Responsibility and lines of accountability are clearly allocated. Management information systems are used to record and disseminate information about the programme, as well as to facilitate review and improvement.
Programme design and approval	Clear and efficient systems and procedures are in place for the design and approval of new programmes, courses and modules. The requirements are consistently applied and regularly monitored.
Staffing	Recruitment, selection, development and support policies and procedures facilitate the availability of suitably qualified and experienced academic and support staff to deliver the programme. Staff capacity in relation to programme needs is regularly reviewed.
Programme review	Clear and effective systems are in place (including internal and external peer review) to evaluate programmes on a regular basis. Review findings are disseminated appropriately and utilised for staff development, curriculum improvement and increasing student access and success.
Management of assessment	The institution has an assessment policy and clear and effective procedures for its implementation. The policy and its procedures ensure academic and professional standards in the design, approval, implementation and review of assessment strategies for programmes and modules, and for the qualifications awarded by the institution.
Moderation system	The institution has effective procedures which facilitate the quality of the internal and external moderation of its assessment procedures and results, in order to ensure their reliability and to ensure the integrity of the qualifications it awards.
Explicitness, fairness and consistency of assessment practices. Security of recording and documenting assessment data	The principles, procedures and practices of assessment are explicit, fair and consistently applied throughout the institution. Security arrangements for recording and documenting assessment data are in place to ensure the credibility of outcomes.
Recognition of prior learning	The institution has an RPL policy, and effective procedures for recognising prior learning and assessing current competence.
General quality-related arrangements for research	Effective arrangements are in place for the quality assurance, development and monitoring of research functions and postgraduate education.

The HAQAA Initiative · Southern Africa

South Africa	Description
(for all higher education institutions)	
Quality-related arrangements for research (in depth evaluation for research intensive institutions)	Research functions and processes are supported and developed in a way that assures and enhances quality, and increases research participation, research productivity and research resources.
Quality-related arrangements for postgraduate education	Efficient arrangements are in place for the quality assurance, development and monitoring of postgraduate education.
Community engagement	Quality-related arrangements for community engagement are formalised and integrated with those for teaching and learning, where appropriate, and are adequately resourced and monitored.
Benchmarking, user surveys and impact studies	The institution engages in benchmarking, where appropriate, and draws on user surveys and impact studies in the process of planning and setting of priorities for quality development and enhancement.

Lesotho	Description
Standard	16 standards with criteria being described for each standard separately, as shown below.
The vision and mission of the institution	The higher education institution has an explicit vision and mission statement as well as strategic planning systems and processes that can support the achievement of the vision and mission.
Institutional governance and management	The higher education institution has a well-established governance and management structure that provides strategic leadership on all aspects pertaining to the higher education institution as well as on its quality assurance systems and processes.
Quality assurance system	The higher education institution has a policy, system/s and relevant procedures for the assurance of quality.
Programme design and development	The higher education institution has policies and systems in place to ensure not only the quality of its programme design and development but also the fitness for purpose and relevance of developed programmes to national and industry needs.
Student recruitment, selection and admission	The higher education institution has policies and procedures, including fair and equitable guidelines and processes, in place for the recruitment, selection and admission of students into its programme.
Teaching and learning	The higher education institution gives recognition to the importance of promoting student learning and has explicit policies setting out teaching, learning for the range of programmes being offered. The teaching and learning strategy is appropriate for the institutional type and mode/s of delivery (contact or distance).
Student assessment	The higher education institution has explicit policies setting out its assessment procedures for formative and summative assessment; internal and external moderation; monitoring of student progress; explicitness, validity and reliability of assessment practices; recording of assessment results; settling of disputes; the rigour and security of the assessment system.
Monitoring of student progression	The institution monitors student progress and has guidelines and services in place for the identification and support of at risk students.
Staffing	The academic and support staff at the higher education institution are sufficiently qualified and appropriately experienced to ensure quality education, research and community engagement.
Facilities and infrastructure	The higher education institution has the necessary physical facilities, resources and infrastructure required to support the nature and scope of programmes being offered.
Management information system	The higher education institution has developed and maintains an effective management information system that facilitates the recording and processing of student information and provides data for management planning.
Financial and administrative systems	The higher education institution has appropriate financial and administrative systems in place which enables it to support the academic activities and tasks of the institution.
Review of programmes	The institution has procedures in place for the regular and systematic review of faculties, units and directorates and for programme evaluation aimed at continuous improvement and quality assurance.
Research activities	The higher education institution encourages, promotes and engages in research and development work aimed at innovation and of national interest.
Internationalization	The higher education institution has strategies in place that promote the internationalization of its programmes and activities.
Community engagement	The higher education institution has a policy and procedures in place that promote its community and corporate social responsibility.

Namibia	Description
Criteria	16 audit criteria, as listed below.
Institutional vision, mission and goals	<p>The institution's vision and mission are responsive to the Namibian and international context and geared towards assurance of the quality of the academic outcomes. (1) The institution has a clear, widely consulted and formally approved strategic vision statement as the guiding concept of what it would like to be in the future and the role it intends to play in the longer term. (2) The institution has a clear and formally approved mission statement that articulates the strategic vision, and expresses in a concise way the purpose and character of the institution. (3) The vision and mission statements are shaped by relevant Namibian legislation and national policies, as well as by other relevant contextual forces and realities at local, national and international levels. (4) The institution's vision and mission, as well as its governance and management processes, are geared towards assurance of the quality of the academic outcomes. (5) Progress towards achievement of the vision, mission and goals of the institution is monitored and evaluated in terms of agreed-upon performance indicators, and the institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified.</p>
Institutional quality assurance management system (IQAMS)	<p>An efficient institutional quality assurance management system is in place and it is continuously monitored and improved. (1) IQAMS is formally established, functions efficiently in the framework of approved policies, procedures and mechanisms, and is adequately resourced. (2) The various forms of planning (strategic, institutional, academic, financial, etc.) are coordinated with a view to ensuring the quality of the academic outcomes. (3) Continuous as well as periodic internal and external evaluations of the institution's academic and support functions by means of peer evaluation are an integral part of IQAMS.</p>
Human resource management system	<p>The management of human resources is conducted within an approved framework of institutional strategies, policies and arrangements for acquiring, deploying and utilising sufficient numbers of qualified and experienced academic and support staff in order to meet the human resource needs of the institution in such a way that the quality of academic outcome is ensured. (1) The human resources management system includes strategies, policies and arrangements for recruitment, appointments, record-keeping, labour relations, employment equity, performance management, compensation and benefits, and training and development. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the human resources management system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the human resources management system.</p>
Financial resource management system	<p>The management of financial resources is conducted within an approved framework of institutional strategies, policies and arrangements to enable the institution to meet its financial needs in such a manner that the quality of the academic outcomes can be assured. (1) The financial management system includes strategies, policies and arrangements for budgeting, resource allocation, asset management, debt management and financial reporting. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the financial management system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the financial management system.</p>
Facilities management system	<p>The management of facilities is conducted within an approved framework of institutional strategies, policies and arrangements to enable the institution to meet its facilities needs in such a manner that the quality of the academic outcomes can be assured. (1) The facilities management system includes strategies, policies and arrangements for facilities planning and acquisitions, the direction of design and construction activities, maintenance of buildings, grounds and equipment, space assignments and utilisation, and real estate management. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the facilities management system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges</p>

Namibia	Description
	<p>identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the facilities management system.</p>
<p>Planning and approval of academic offerings</p>	<p>There is an efficient system for the planning and approval of new programmes and changes to existing programmes, courses and curricula. The system is geared towards aligning academic offerings with the institution’s vision, mission and goals, and ensuring the quality of academic outcomes. (1) This system includes strategies, policies and arrangements for: development and institutional approval of new qualifications and programmes in order to set appropriate academic standards, and to ensure that all the relevant legal requirements (including accreditation requirements set by relevant authorities) are met, continuous curriculum renewal to ensure the academic offering’s academic integrity, alignment with new knowledge and skills, and responsiveness and relevance to the needs of the students and the country, development and institutional approval of academic partnerships with institutions within and outside Namibia. This includes joint offerings, external moderation and examination, joint/ double degrees, recognition of credits, etc., development and institutional approval of short courses, effective and reliable central management of information on the institution’s academic offerings (qualifications, programmes, courses, modules, short courses, partnerships, etc). (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the system for planning and approval of academic offerings with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address risks, gaps and challenges identified through monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes, in order to continuously improve the system for planning and approval of academic offerings.</p>
<p>Enrolment planning</p>	<p>There is an efficient system for planning the number of students to be enrolled in the different programmes/courses. The system is geared towards aligning the institution’s size and shape with its vision, mission, goals and capacity, and ensuring the quality of the academic outcomes. (1) The enrolment planning system includes strategies, policies and arrangements for: the gathering and interpretation of accurate and up-to-date information on institutional capacity and historical trends to inform the planning process, internal and external approval of enrolment targets by the relevant authorities, tracking and reporting on enrolments. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the enrolment planning system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve enrolment planning.</p>
<p>Student enrolment management system (SEMS)</p>	<p>There is an efficient student enrolment management system that is geared towards ensuring the quality of the academic outcomes. (1) The SEMS includes strategies, policies and arrangements for: marketing (information on the institution, the programmes / courses on offer, financial support, housing, etc.), recruitment (including outreach to schools and other target markets), admissions, selection (where appropriate), and registration. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the student enrolment management system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the process of the student enrolment management system.</p>
<p>Academic support services</p>	<p>The institution provides efficient academic support services geared towards ensuring the quality of the academic outcomes and enhancing student success. (1) Student support services include strategies, policies and arrangements for: academic development services geared towards the enhancement of academic skills, student counselling services, access to academic information and learning materials through efficient library services and information technology centres, enabling students to meet their learning objectives. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the student support services with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the student support services.</p>

Namibia	Description
Facilitation of learning	<p>The institution has efficient systems in place to ensure that teaching and learning leads to quality academic outcomes and student success. (1) The institution's activities to facilitate learning include strategies, policies and arrangements for: ensuring that a range of learning opportunities appropriate to the learning outcomes are deployed, including, for example, formal lectures, group work, service learning, etc., ensuring that staff are competent to teach the programmes/courses allocated to them and offering staff development opportunities to enhance their knowledge and competences in learning facilitation, ensuring that the quality of the learning experience on satellite campuses and tuition centres is comparable to that on the main campus. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the learning facilitation activities with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes, in order to continuously improve its learning facilitation activities.</p>
Assessment of student learning	<p>The institution has an efficient system to assess student learning that is geared towards ensuring the quality of the academic outcomes and enhancing student success. (1) The system for assessment of student learning includes strategies, policies and arrangements for: regulations and procedures related to student assessment, including, for example, the security of test and examination papers, composition and calculation of marks, supplementary/special assessment opportunities, disciplinary and appeals procedures, internal and external moderation and examinations, etc., ensuring that staff are competent to conduct student assessment in the programmes/courses allocated to them and offering staff development opportunities to enhance their knowledge and competencies in student assessment, ensuring that the assessment events on satellite campuses and tuition centres meet the same requirements as those on the main campus, the effective and reliable central management of the students' marks and learner records that guarantees the security of the data. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the assessment system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the system for the assessment of student learning.</p>
Certification of student learning	<p>The accuracy and integrity of all the certificates issued by the institution are guaranteed. (1) The certification system includes strategies, policies and arrangements for: - accurate and secure data capturing and management, regular internal software control procedures, security measures to avoid fraud. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the certification system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the process of the certification system.</p>
Tracking, review and feedback systems	<p>There are effective systems to track student performance, gather student feedback, review programmes and courses, gather feedback from stakeholders and provide feedback on learning and teaching matters to students, staff and other stakeholders. (1) The tracking, review and feedback systems include strategies, policies and arrangements for: the tracking of student performance (including success rates, throughput rates, graduation rates), with regular reports enabling appropriate interventions by all the parties concerned, regular opportunities for student feedback on the quality of their programmes and courses, learning opportunities, teaching, and the total student learning experience, internal and external review of programmes/courses with a view to continuous quality enhancement, surveys of stakeholders (graduates, employers, etc.) aimed at the enhancement of institutional insight with a view to the improvement of the quality of learning and teaching. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the tracking, review and feedback systems with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the process of the tracking, review and feedback systems.</p>

Namibia	Description
<p>Management of postgraduate studies</p>	<p>The management of postgraduate studies is conducted within an approved framework of institutional strategies, policies and arrangements to enable the institution to meet its needs in such a manner that the quality of postgraduate studies can be assured. (1) The postgraduate studies management system includes strategies, policies and arrangements for: the design, approval, offering, evaluation and continuous improvement of postgraduate programmes contributing to the high level human capacity and skills required by the development needs of Namibia, criteria and processes for the approval of research proposals for masters and doctoral studies, including criteria that will enhance the alignment of postgraduate research projects with the needs of Namibia, the support and development of postgraduate students, including support in the development of research projects, research methodology, etc., requirements and codes of conduct for supervisors and postgraduate students, the assessment of postgraduate study projects (including assignments, theses, dissertations, etc.), the effective and trustworthy central management of postgraduate student information. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the postgraduate management system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately on the risks, gaps and challenges identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the post-graduate management system.</p>
<p>The research management system</p>	<p>The management of the institution's research is conducted within an approved framework of institutional strategies, policies and arrangements to enable the institution to meet its needs in such a manner that the quality of the research activities can be assured. (1) The research management system includes strategies, policies and arrangements providing for: a shared understanding of the nature, role and goals of research at the institution, criteria and processes for the approval of research proposals, including criteria that will enhance the alignment of research projects with the needs of Namibia, the support and development of the capacity of new and established researchers, the management of research partnerships and research contracts, the handling of intellectual property and the commercialisation of research, the effective and trustworthy central management of research information. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the research management system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately on the risks, gaps and challenges identified through the monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the research management system.</p>
<p>The community engagement planning and management system</p>	<p>The management of the institution's community engagement activities is conducted within an approved framework of institutional strategies, policies and arrangements to enable the institution to meet its needs in such a manner that the quality of the community engagement activities can be assured. (1) The research management system includes strategies, policies and arrangements providing for: a shared understanding of the nature, role and goals of community engagement by the institution, criteria and processes for the approval of community engagement projects, including criteria that will enhance the alignment of these projects with the needs of the students and communities, and the needs of Namibia, the support and development of community engagement activities conducted by staff and students, the management of partnerships with communities, the effective and trustworthy central management of information related to community engagement activities. (2) It is standard practice to monitor and evaluate the approach, deployment and results of the community engagement management system with reference to international best practices. (3) The institution acts appropriately to address the risks, gaps and challenges identified through monitoring, evaluation and benchmarking processes in order to continuously improve the community engagement management system.</p>

SADC	Description
<p>Guideline</p>	<p>Containing nine groups of general guidelines that further split into 13 specific guidelines and constitute focal areas for internal QA in HEIs, as shown below.</p>

The HAQAA Initiative · Southern Africa

SADC	Description
Vision, mission, objects and strategic rolling plans of an institution	Every institution shall: (1) have its clearly defined vision, mission and objects including its strategic development plan and clear timelines for the achievement of the different development targets; (2) observe and adhere to established requirements and procedures for institutional recognition, registration and accreditation; (3) aspire to improve and enhance the quality and relevance of education they offer their students.
Institutional governance and management	Every institution shall: (1) have a qualified, competent and experienced Chief Executive Officer to oversee all development, management and quality functions of the institution; (2) ensure participatory management system through the establishment of relevant organs of governance, each with clear mandates, duties, responsibilities, powers, privileges and tenure; (3) have a clear organizational structure, information, communication and decision making system; (4) ensure that its management and governance structures are robust enough to inspire public confidence that the programmes and courses being offered are competently designed, delivered, supervised and regularly evaluated; (5) ensure that has in place a clear communication systems as well as networking and cooperation arrangements to maintain and promote internal information circulation, external academic cross fertilization and public interphase and accountability.
Infrastructure and sustainable financing	Every owner, sponsor and management of an education institution shall: (1) institute clear mechanisms to diversify its financial resource base and ensure balanced allocation of resource to the core functions of teaching, research and community services; (2) adopt and adhere to guidelines for standards of physical infrastructure, facilities and services for education purposes; (3) ensure diverse and sustainable financial resources and proper financial management and accounting for capital development, recurrent expenditure and regular repair and maintenance of infrastructure and facilities; (4) ensure the appointment and use of qualified and experienced architects and construction engineers to undertake the design, construction and regular maintenance and repair of infrastructure for academic, research, administrative and technical support services, while adhering to established standards for educational facilities.
Institutional integrity, ethos and strategic development planning	Every institution shall: (1) have a legal personality, clear vision and mission statements as well as strategic development plan; (2) ensure that graduates in all fields of studies are of creditable and high quality and are able to demonstrate their competitiveness and acceptability in world markets for trained labour; (3) ensure regular consultations, reporting and follow up actions on key issues of policy and operations such as to promote cohesion, harmony and identity with the institution; (4) establish mechanisms for partnership with industry, commerce and other public functions as means to ensure transparency and public accountability; (5) promote a high degree of institutional integrity and responsiveness to change by subscribing to advocating and demonstrating honestly and truthfulness in its treatment of staff, students, members of the public and in the management of the institution's affairs; (6) publish, on a regular basis, impartial and objective qualitative and quantitative information about courses offered, research undertaken and extension services provided and other activities.
Academic programmes and courses	Every higher education institution, working closely with the relevant in-country or regional Quality Assurance Agency shall: (1) offer only academic and professional programmes which have a mark of recognition and approval by the relevant in-country QAA; (2) offer academic programmes that are sufficiently high in cognitive content and delivery system as to produce graduates that reflect publicly anticipated growth in skills and competencies in particular fields and levels of study; (3) institute formal mechanisms for the approval, periodic reviews and monitoring of programmes and awards, (4) ensure that all academic programmes and courses offered are relevant and adequate in content and scope; (5) ensure that all courses are designed such that they promote core content, ideas and values, achievable within the planned time of an education cycle; enable the achievement of clear and transparent educational goals and planned final qualifications; facilitate student mobility between programmes and institutions; (6) ensure that programmes of a professional nature are subjected to the validation and approval process involving the relevant professional body; (7) provide for breadth and in-depth knowledge, key learning outcomes and standards of achievement in literacy, basic mathematics, computer applications, and soft skills of learning to learn, social competences, communication and self-management work and life skills; (8) specify the duration of each programme in terms of academic years structured by elaborate semesters; (9) be periodically reviewed to provide for previous and further education, changing needs of life resulting from tracer studies of former graduates, key qualifications, and labour market expectations.
Teaching and learning environment and resources	Every institution shall ensure: (1) that the teaching and learning environment and resources are appropriate and adequate to support students' learning in each programme; (2) that it has adequate and well-resourced facilities, equipment, fixtures and materials for academic

The HAQAA Initiative · Southern Africa

SADC	Description
	and research and consultancy work including lecture halls, classrooms, seminar rooms, library, reading rooms, science and research laboratories, workshops and relevant equipment and materials; (3) that it possesses teaching and learning resources that are adequate in depth, diversity, currency and appropriateness and are effectively utilized to support the institution's academic programmes to produce the planned quality outputs; (4) the availability of up to date / state of the art teaching and learning materials for each programme including essential reference books and journals; (5) electronic networking with other libraries and resource centres and that students and staff has open access to computers for this service.
Access and admission systems	Every school and higher learning institution shall: (1) publish transparent information on its access and admissions policy that ensures admission on merit, promotes diversity of the students' body by backgrounds, compensates for persons with special needs and eliminates all forms of discrimination; (2) ensure that all applicants selected for courses in higher education meet general and programme specific entry requirements as issued by individual institutions and approved by the relevant QAA; (3) ensure students' retention through meeting their diverse needs, adequate educational offers, practical training opportunities, counselling and supportive teaching and learning methods, equipment and other resources.
Staff recruitment, development, promotion and retention	Every institution shall: (1) have a clear policy and plan for staff recruitment, appointment, development, remuneration and retention; (2) recruit a core of qualified, permanent academic staff to lay foundations for commitment to quality and loyalty to the mission of the institution; (3) contracts academic staff, on defined renewable periods and under clear terms and conditions of service to ensure continuity of academic life and research activities of the institution; (4) encourage and facilitate its permanent academic staff to participate in public life and service delivery in their respective professions and specializations without compromising their duties of effective teaching, research and publishing. This move will avail academic staff with opportunities to practice what they teach and bring the field experiences into the institutions; (5) ensure that all academic, research and administrative staff are qualified and consistently demonstrate professionalism, dutifulness and commitment to the institution's defined mission and objectives; (6) ensure that for each subject there is an adequate number of a core permanent staff reflecting lecturer: student ratios appropriate for each field of studies; (7) observe and ensure that honorary degrees are not treated as academic qualifications and should not, therefore, be used as bases for academic appointments or job placement in institutions; (8) have clear mechanisms, namely, the use of the institution's appointed organs or committees, for ascertaining that staff involved in teaching, research and consultancy are qualified and competent to do so.
Modes of delivery of education	All teaching and learning processes shall: (1) be effective, learner involving, friendly and responsive to divergent individual needs, and provide learning support to students; (2) promote achievement of an institutional mission and objects of the subject; (3) provide for mastery of subject knowledge, key competences, and problem solving skills oriented.
Students' assessment system	Every school and educational institution should: (1) develop, publish and ensure consistent application of coherent principles, policies, criteria, procedures, instruments and marking schedules for students' testing, formative and general assessment; (2) make available to students, information about the institution's rules and regulations including examinations rules and conditions for course completion and graduation; (3) ensure that students' assessment is carried out by competent and impartial examiners through the engagement of external examiners who should ensure that justice is done to individual students while maintaining the standards of awards; (4) ensure that students' performance assessment systems are objective, fair and transparent; (5) ensure that students' assessment criteria, procedures and rating systems are transparent, objective, and fair and are applied consistently; (6) ensure that students receive objective and regular feedback on their strengths and weaknesses including appropriate counselling and support to help them improve; (7) ensure that the final examinations system is transparent, has inbuilt early warning system and the outcomes are used to improve the system for greater competitiveness of the graduates; (8) compile data of qualitative output indicators focusing on students' access to and performance in higher studies or professions as well as quantitative indicators targeting duration of studies against drop out, completion and graduation rates and uses such data to plan for further improvement of quality.
Research	Every institution shall ensure that: (1) it has an effective research and publications policy and profile and engages in effective knowledge generation, advancement, preservation and dissemination; (2) all research undertaken is relevant and responsive to the need for academic advancement and community development expectations.
Students' welfare services and gender mainstreaming	The top leaderships and general management of every higher education institution shall ensure that: (1) its policies promote provide affirmative actions for the involvement of women in all the affairs of the institution including decision making processes and

SADC	Description
	appointment to leadership and management positions; (2) it has a well-resourced students' development, welfare, support and counselling policy and services to promote adequate learning and to ease academic access, progress and success.
Quality management system	Every higher education institution in the SADC Region shall: (1) have a policy and associated procedures for the assurance of internal quality and standards of inputs, processes and outputs; (2) have effective quality assurance mechanisms in place including students' entry qualifications, structure of degrees, durations of studies and conditions for course completion and graduation to guarantee that academic processes lead to high quality graduates, research outcomes and expert public services; (3) operate in line with established and internally agreed internal quality assurance, self-assessment, academic audit, external peer review and re-accreditation requirements; (4) strive to be a creditable, world class centre of excellence for academic, research and community service; (5) periodically evaluates its credibility and effectiveness in the delivery of relevant programmes, responsiveness to societal needs and employability of its graduates as determined through tracer studies; (6) periodically articulates its mission, objectives in a coherent short and long term development plan including analyses of strengths and constraints, and re-affirming what it exists for and how it intends to pursue its objectives; (7) ensure that, in the event that it closes down or is required to close down the business of running courses in higher education, it bears responsibility for relocating existing students to other appropriate institutions.

5.2 External QA

Namibia	Description
Principle	Eight core principles for external quality assurance, as listed below. The listed principles are not titled.
	Higher education institutions have primary responsibility for quality and the assurance thereof. NCHE's audit system complements institutional quality assurance mechanisms by setting and monitoring national benchmarks against which institutional quality assurance mechanisms are evaluated.
	The institutional audit system should improve the quality of higher education by evaluating institutional quality assurance systems against national requirements, and through fostering a culture of continuous, systematic and responsive quality assurance in higher education institutions.
	The institutional audit system supports ETSIP as the blue print that will guide strategic interventions aimed at responding to the obligation placed on the sector by Vision 2030, namely that of guaranteeing Namibia's transition to a knowledge-driven economy and the attainment of equitable social development.
	The institutional audit system should be fully contextualised within Namibia's specific circumstances and needs, and should be in congruence with the country's legislative and policy frameworks for higher education.
	The institutional audit system is applicable to public and private higher education institutions and all sites of delivery, as part of a coordinated higher education system.
	The institutional audit system should be fit for its purpose: it should entail appropriate and necessary mechanisms for achieving its objectives.
	The institutional audit system should be transparent, user-friendly, and adaptable.
	The institutional audit system should be manageable in the context of the capacity and resources available in higher education for this purpose. The need for ongoing capacity development at national and institutional levels, as well as the need for adequate resourcing, are acknowledged.

SADC	Description
Principle	Four main chapters of four main principles that cover external QA.
Mission	External Quality Assurance for education and training assists individual higher education institutions to: (1) develop internal quality culture and quality management systems; (2) develop and or improve the institution's quality assurance policy and system, (3) provide bases for explicit comparison of inputs, processes and outputs with other institutions within the same country or internationally (benchmarking); (4) determine the institution's capability to offer academic programmes; (5) provide a basis for the institution's continued and increased funding by the owners and donors; (6) justify the institution's autonomy and matching public accountability; (7) check the institution's compliance with

SADC	Description
	<p>legal and other requirements; (8) provide independent information about the institution to its stakeholders namely, prospective students, employers, and financiers; (9) justify a country's quality and standards of its higher education sector as a whole.</p>
<p>Objectives of external quality assurance</p>	<p>External quality of an institution is normally assessed and assured by reviewers, external to the institution, and who may be appointed by the concerned institution or by an External and independent External Quality Assurance Agency wherever it exists. External quality assurance: (1) enables a higher education institution to assure itself, its stakeholders, the general public and the international community that its policies, systems and processes for the development, maintenance and enhancement of quality in all its educational offerings are functioning effectively; (2) provides a critical information that will enable the institution to acquire accreditation and to take responsibility for internal quality assurance; (3) enables providers of education to identify areas of strength and excellence as well as areas in need of improvement in the short medium and long terms; (4) provides for consistency in the adherence to established quality assurance guidelines and principles across the higher education sector and so provides a country's clear position about the role of quality assurance in the transformation and improvement of its higher education sub - sector.</p>
<p>Principles guiding external quality assessment and academic audits</p>	<p>(1) The primary responsibility for quality and quality assurance rests with individual higher education providers who are required to establish and sustain effective institutional quality assurance policies, systems and processes that will provide reliable information for internal planning, and improvement as well as external assessment, evaluation and academic audits. (2) The external evaluation and academic audits of institutions validate the effectiveness of internal operations and quality assurance arrangements, for the core functions of teaching and learning, research and community service and provide the institution and its stakeholders with reliable information about the validity and credibility of education processes undertaken. (3) External quality assessment and academic audits allows an institution to account, to relevant stakeholders, how effectively it is achieving its mission and objects quantitatively and qualitatively and to plan for further improvement in future. (4) The use of peer review is an effective external evaluation of an institution by a group of male and female external experts invited by an institution or sent by a QAA to conduct an independent assessment, evaluation and validation of inputs, processes and outputs of programmes and the extent to which the entire institution is operating in line with the established vision, mission and objects.</p>
<p>Guidelines for institutional external quality audit and assurance</p>	<p>An External Quality Assurance Agency, though autonomous in its determination of the status of usually established and mandated by state laws, will give itself guiding and ethical principles to ensure its objectivity and fairness in all judgments made by expert reviewers appointed to visit and evaluate the status of quality in any institution. Institutional external quality assurance mechanisms in the SADC Region shall: (1) determine in advance, the purposes and objectives of the assessment with a focus on how the procedures will be beneficial to the institution; (2) be dynamic, continuous and periodically renewed. It should therefore be undertaken in pre-determined and clearly defined and published cycles to enable institutions to prepare well in advance; (3) ensure the validity, reliability, usefulness and fitness for purpose of the defined external quality assurance objectives and mechanisms for the SADC Region; (4) ensure care in the selection of QA peer reviewers and specifically that the experts appointed represent different interests in higher education – representatives of the higher education sub-sector, employers, professional associations, civil society, alumni; (5) peer reviewers selected to undertake the technical visitation, assessment and evaluation have appropriate skills and competences to perform the tasks assigned, namely academic and professional qualifications, oral and written communication skills, knowledge of and commitment to education quality culture, freedom from conflict of interest in the assigned task and openness, objectivity and freedom from prejudices and preconceived ideas; (6) ensure advance briefing of the selected peer reviewers providing them with an opportunity to strategize their assignment; (7) aim at validating the effectiveness of the institution's internal quality assurance policy and process and the findings of the internal self-study and assessment report; (8) ensure that all judgments and decisions made by the peer review teams are based on explicit and published criteria applied consistently; (9) recognize the importance of institutional reviews, transformation, improvement and enhancement policies and plans as fundamental and part of the quality assurance policy; (10) ensure that the peer review reports are organized in structure, content, style and tone and are clear and meet the needs and expectations of the intended readership; (11) produce reports which clearly indicate the purpose of the review, methodology and procedures used, areas visited and persons consulted, key findings, commendations, recommendations and conclusions; (12) be characterized by inbuilt follow – up procedures for actions taken by the institution to implement recommendations which are normally made in the interest of the institution and its owners.</p>

5.3 Standards and guidelines for internal QA for Open and Distance Learning

SADC	Description
Guideline	The document contains eight guidelines for QA in open and distance learning.
Design of programmes and curricula	Institutions recognized and registered to provide ODL shall: (1) design and manage distance learning programmes in accordance with defined institutional policies and operational procedures for open and distance learning; (2) ensure that distance learning programmes constitute part of the institutional mission and strategy for achieving defined teaching and learning objectives.
Approval and periodic review of programmes	Every provider of ODL shall ensure that: (1) their programmes are delivered in ways and benchmarks consistent with those applicable to other recognized institutions; (2) they have efficient and effective internal and external mechanisms for scrutiny and approval of distance learning programmes; (3) programmes of study are regularly monitored, reviewed and subjected to periodic re-approval and quality assurance.
Admission criteria	All providers of academic programmes under the open and distance learning mode shall: (1) establish and publish clear criteria and procedures, to be applied consistently, for the selection of would be students, while ensuring access by women, persons with disabilities and those from diverse socio – economic, cultural and geographical backgrounds; (2) have an admission office set up to provide information about admissions procedures, programmes offered and fees payable including available students' support services including those for adult learners from all backgrounds.
Teaching and learning resources	Every provider of ODL shall ensure availability and equitable access, by all students at affordable costs, of relevant learning materials which should include printed, audio, audio-visual, experimental materials, materials on the World Wide Web and other electronic or computer-based learning resources.
Delivery of courses	Every institution providing open and distance learning programmes shall ensure that: (1) all students and course providers have minimum levels of literacy in computer applications to enable effective provision and access to courses provided through ICT; (2) it is responsible for managing the delivery of each programme in a manner that safeguards academic standards and awards; (3) it is responsible for ensuring that all programmes are delivered in a manner that provides students with a fair and reasonable chance of achieving academic standards required for completion of studies; (4) distance learning is participatory through regular feedbacks between students and course providers to enhance teaching and learning; (5) it has effective development programmes of proper training for faculty staff to manage distance learning programmes; (6) it has attractive incentives policies and packages for compensation to course facilitators; (7) it has policies for the protection and handling of intellectual property and copy right issues; and that there is constant assessment of adequacy of and ensured student internet connectivity even during peak hours by posting minimum hardware and software requirements, reviewing them regularly and addressing issues of bandwidth, un-met software and hardware requirements, and server up-time.
Student development and support	Every provider of ODL programmes shall: (1) provide full and clear information about the nature and expectations of each programme of study, the characteristics of distance learning, the relationship between achievements and assessment, academic achievement and accumulation of credits and how students can interact with the management altogether to enable would be students to make informed decision about their own education; (2) make efforts to understand students' backgrounds, circumstances and unique needs and possible challenges they may face; (3) make sure that course facilitators create friendly environments that will welcome students of all races, cultures and other backgrounds; and (4) ensure that counselling services are available to students to assist them with class or course problems, instructor conflicts etc.
Student assessment	Institutions offering open and distance learning shall: (1) demonstrate publicly that students' diagnostic, formative and summative assessment procedures used are appropriate for the programmes offered and that assessments are conducted, marked and the results released in a properly regulated manner; (2) demonstrate that assessment of programmes of study adequately determine students' achievement of pre-determined learning outcomes for each module or programme; (3) Monitor systematically the soundness of existing assessment procedures and practices and should be ready to amend them from time to time to meet intended purposes.
Quality assurance of open and distance learning	Every provider of open, distance and other ICT mediated programmes shall: (1) have and observe the provisions of the befitting quality assurance policy and procedures; (2) ensure sustainable financial bases to safeguard intended institutional internal quality and standards;

SADC	Description
	(3) adhere to external quality assurance requirements of the appropriate in-country or External Quality Assurance Agency.

5.4 QA of quality assurance agencies

SADC	Description
Guideline	21 guidelines for QA of quality assurance agencies. The listed guidelines are not titled.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall be formally established and recognized by competent public authorities within the SADC Region as agencies with legal mandates and responsibilities for external quality assurance of higher learning institutions.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall have adequate human, financial and material resources to enable effective and efficient conduct of their duties and responsibilities.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall develop its own vision and mission reflecting the given legal objectives and mandates.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall develop and adhere to its own guiding and ethical principles to guide objectivity; and fairness in all its judgments, decisions and conclusions.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall be independent and autonomous and the conclusions and recommendations made in their reports cannot be influenced by third parties such as higher education institutions themselves, government ministries or other interested parties.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall ensure that every institution of higher learning has a quality assurance policy, culture and system, and that all academic, research, community service and other functions and activities of the institution are conducted in accordance with the institution's quality assurance policy and processes.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall ensure that external quality arrangements for higher education institutions are guidelines of a general nature, are not prescriptive and therefore do not interfere with institutional autonomies but help to guarantee to all stakeholders and the international community about the overall professionalism, visibility, transparency, credibility, integrity, and quality of a country's higher education sub-sector.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall ensure that criteria and processes used to regulate the quality and relevance of higher education institutions are pre-determined, pre-defined, published and made available to institutions ahead of external visits - institutional internal self-assessment and quality assurance criteria and procedures, external technical visitation and quality determination and assurance mechanisms, follow up mechanisms for actions on recommendations given for further improvement etc.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall ensure that it operates in line with established guidelines and mechanisms for internal and external quality assurance as used and or observed by institutions.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall undertake as its core functions of external quality assessment, evaluation, accreditation, review and assurance of institutions and academic and research programmes on a regular basis, and provide, in advance, due frameworks to concerned institutions.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall ensure the comparability of standards of quality for all public and private institutions in a state.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall produce, from time to time, summary reports to describe and analyse the general trends in the findings of external reviews, assessments and evaluations of institutions and their programmes. Such reports will be of great value to policy makers in higher education and professional training.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall promote and participate in international initiatives, workshops and conferences on quality assurance to exchange and share experiences, best practices and benchmarks.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall establish, or encourage the establishment of a comprehensive, fair and transparent system for registration or licensing for transnational and cross-border education.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall establish, or encourage the establishment of a comprehensive capacity for reliable assessment and quality assurance and accreditation of cross-border education provision, recognizing that quality assurance

The HAQAA Initiative · Southern Africa

SADC	Description
	and accreditation of cross-border education involve cooperation and mutual agreements between sending and receiving countries.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall collaborate with all competent bodies for quality assurance and accreditation both nationally and internationally through exchange and sharing of information and best practices in education quality assurance.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall share nationally, regionally and internationally, accurate, reliable and easily accessible information on the criteria and standards for registration, licensure, quality assurance and accreditation of all modes of education delivery.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall contribute to the development and/or updating of the appropriate UNESCO regional and other international conventions on the recognition of courses and qualifications and serve as national or regional information centres as appropriate.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall participate in bilateral or multilateral agreements for facilitating the recognition or determination of equivalence of each country's qualifications based on the procedures and criteria included in established international agreements for the recognition of courses and qualifications.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall contribute to regional and international efforts to improve the accessibility at the international level, of up-to-date, accurate and comprehensive information on recognized higher education institutions or providers.
	Every External Quality Assurance Agency in the SADC Region shall adhere and contribute to established state, regional and international mechanisms for integrity, transparency and public accountability as an authentic quality assurance agency.

6. Western Africa

6.1 Internal QA

Gambia	Description
Standard	Seven standards.
Be an entity	Be registered by the Attorney General. Be established by legislation. Be registered by NGO Affairs.
Have clear structures	Have organisational chart and mission statement, responsibilities and allocation of functions and accountabilities. Have senior managers capable of and able to provide organisational and educational leadership and make sound management decisions.
Be financially viable	Have a minimum working capital of D30,000.00 (2006) for running expenses only. Have a financial controller/ manager. Review systematically financial requirements and act as the need be. Have audit report of accounts at least annually, by a recognised accounting firm. Document and implement systems to protect fees paid in advance. Exercise sound financial practices and internal control. Meet the financial regulations and be in position to sustain this position.
Have clear purpose	Have stated vision, mission statement, goals and objectives in place. Have outline of scope of operation, state in terms of learning areas and levels. Have equity and access policy. Have evidence of alignment of operations with relevant regional, national and industry development activities, state activities outside your organisation. State involvement in stakeholders organisational activities. State involvement in industry and community activities.
Serve interest of learners	Provide a clear rational for the type of programmes and services offered in terms of characteristics of learner and learning needs. Must integrate HIV/AIDS into training and provide education and support programmes on HIV/AIDS. Buildings and other infrastructure must at least meet the minimum requirements of the local authorities (health and safety regulation). Enrol trainees in programme in which they will have a reasonable chance of success. Have in place environment and admission criteria. Provide guidance on future learning and career pathways. Have in place documented procedure for reporting learner attainment. Have information dissemination materials for trainees. Transfer learners achievement result to awarding and regulatory bodies as soon as possible after the results are attained. Must have a fair and equitable refund policy. Have documents and system in place that can be implemented to protect fees paid in advance.
Be comitted to own people	Have staff recruitment and development policy. Have policy on equity and access for staff recruitment and development. Have comprehensive staff development programme. Have efficient and effective information dissemination mechanism on institution activities. Have staff involve in planning and decision making.
Be comitted to quality	Have quality management system that encompass all operations. All staff actively involve in self evaluation of policies, procedures and performance. Performance indicators related to mission statement, goals and objectives are measured regularly. Ensure that services are delivered by persons with relevant competencies in training. Trainers and assessors are able to demonstrate subject knowledge and competencies in a given sub-field or domain. Demonstrate sound practice in planning, conducting and reviewing assessment. Ensure that regional, local, community, stakeholders and learners are engaged in providing feedback on the relevance and usefulness of programmes and the graduates from the institutions.

The HAQAA Initiative · Western Africa

Ghana	Description
Norm	Five groups of norms for tertiary education (with separate documents for universities and for polytechnics). The below presented norms are for universities.
Enrolments	Mostly numerical thresholds, for more information see Annex XXI.
Student:academic staff ratio (STR)	Mostly numerical thresholds, for more information see Annex XXI.
Personnel	Mostly numerical thresholds, for more information see Annex XXI.
Financial norms	Mostly numerical thresholds, for more information see Annex XXI.
Student accommodation	Mostly numerical thresholds, for more information see Annex XXI.

Nigeria	Description
Standard	Benchmark Minimum Academic Standards (BMAS) documents, classified into 13 major disciplines for Nigerian universities
	See the specific document for each of the following disciplines: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Administration; Management and Management Technology 2. Agriculture, Forestry, Fisheries and Home Economics 3. Arts 4. Basic Medical and Health Science 5. Education 6. Engineering and Technology 7. Environmental Sciences 8. Law 9. Pharmaceutical Sciences 10. Medicine and Dentistry 11. Science 12. Social Sciences 13. Veterinary Medicine

Senegal	Description
Standard	31 standards, grouped into nine standard groups, as shown below. This table has been translated from French.
Strategy, organisation, functioning and the management of quality in the institution	The institution has a public mission which includes its objectives in terms of teaching and research and which sets its position in the academic and social environment. The institution has a strategic plan.
	Decision-making processes, competences and responsibilities are clearly set. The teaching and/or research staff is involved in the decision-making processes related to teaching and/or research.
	The institution has staff, structures and financial and material resources that allow it to fulfil its objectives according to its strategic plan.
	The sources of funding and their conditions are transparent and do not restrict the independence in the decision-making of the institution as regards teaching and research.
	The institution has a quality assurance system.
	The institution has put in place mechanisms to prevent and/or solve conflicts.
Studies and educational provision	The institution offers courses that lead to the obtaining of academic or professional diplomas with specific study and training objectives. They are well integrated with the studies and educational provision that exists in the institution and at the national level or they complement that in a well thought manner.
	The institution participates to national and international mobility of students and staff.
	The institution has defined the conditions for the obtaining of the certificates and academic diplomas. The institution makes sure that those conditions are respected.
	The institution monitors the pedagogical curriculum of its students and the integration of its graduates into working life. The institution makes use of periodically collected data concerning its students and graduates.
	The institution evaluates its programmes periodically to assure their quality (self-evaluation).
Research	The current research activities of the institution match with its strategic plan and correspond to international standards.
	The institution guarantees the integration of up-to-date scientific knowledge in its courses.

The HAQAA Initiative · Western Africa

Senegal	Description
Teaching and/or research staff	The procedures for the selection, nomination and promotion of teaching and/or research staff are in conformity with the national legislation and the CAMES norms, and publically available.
	The institution makes sure there are continuous training and improvement possibilities for the teaching and/or research staff for their didactic and professional skills.
	The institution has a durable policy for handover situations.
	The institution offers a service to advise on for career developments.
Administrative, technical and service staff	The procedures for the recruitment and promotion of administrative, technical and service staff are regulated and made public.
	The institution guarantees the continuous training and development of skills for administrative, technical and service staff.
Students	The conditions and procedures of admission in the study and educational programmes of the institution are in line with the documentation and are made public.
	There are equal opportunities for men and women.
	The institution observes the progress in and the length of the studies of their students.
	The level of supervision should permit that the objectives of the educational provision of the institution and each of its units are being reached.
	The institution guarantees that there is a functioning advisory service available for students and any other interested persons.
	The institution offers special support for students with disabilities.
Infrastructures and equipment	The institution has infrastructures and equipment that allow the accomplishment of its educational and/or research objectives in medium and long terms.
	The information means to which the institution has access allow the institution to support an educational provision and/or a quality research.
	The institution has access to a visible, communicated and integrated security system.
Cooperation	The institution establishes contacts at national, regional and international levels. It promotes the collaboration with other higher education institutions, with the professional world and the relevant social actors.
Information and communication	To take strategic decisions related to the study provisions, research, employment and promotion of the staff (teaching and/or research staff, administrative, technical and service staff), the management of the institution bases its decisions on relevant and current quantitative and qualitative information.
	On internal as much as on external level, the institution follows a policy for communication and sharing of information which is efficient, transparent and objective.

CAMES	Description
Standard	Standards are joined into four main groups: la formation, la politique de recherche, la gouvernance de l'institution au service de ses missions, and la vie a l'universite/ecole/institut, and afterwards listed as below. This table has been translated from French.
Educational provision	The institution offers educational provision in line with its mission, its environment (political, scientific, socio-professional) and the national context. The educational provision is coherent with the institution's project and/or with its strategic plan. The educational provision is in line with the national, regional and international policy. The institution promotes its educational provision. The educational programmes respect the Licence-Master-Doctorate requirements. The educational programmes are designed to promote students' mobility. The educational programmes prepare for the integration into the professional world. The institution offers first-degree and continuous educational provisions (open and distance learning, distance learning combined with training)
Evaluation and revision of programmes	The educational programmes are evaluated regularly. The institution ensures the continuous improvement of applied pedagogies.
Monitoring of students' knowledge and learning	The institutions has a validation strategy for learning throughout the educational pathway. The tests are coherent with the learning objectives. The modalities for the assessment are objective, equitable, reliable, public and communicated. The institution makes sure that the proclamation of the exams results respects the established modalities and calendar.
Students' support	The institution offers students studying in one of the three years of a Bachelor degree (Y1, Y2, Y3) services for pedagogical support aiming at facilitating their success. The institution promotes the participation of students in the institutional management. The institution promotes the integration into the professional world.

The HAQAA Initiative · Western Africa

CAMES	Description
Organisation, structure and development of research	The institution has structures for the piloting and implementation of research. The institution implements its research priorities.
Scientific relationships and partnerships	The institution is set in the national, regional and international context of research.
Research valorisation	The institution has a strategy for the communication and dissemination of its outputs. The institution is positioned in the national, regional and international context of research.
Exercising autonomy	The institution and all of its organisational units and services have a defined status. The internal organisation of the institution permits efficient steering. A democratic debate exists within the institution through different committees. The institution makes use of its autonomy allowance. Every year, the institution, at the central level, or via its different educational and research structures, produces an activity report which demonstrates the transparency of the management.
The institution and its components	The structure of the institution is organised to fully support its missions. The common services contribute to the implementation of the development plan.
The partnerships	The institution has a strategy as regards integration into the professional world. The institution has a strategy as regards international mobility.
Human resources management	The institution has a strategy for the management of vacancies and competencies of the staff.
The financial management	The institution has means to manage its financial strategy. The institution has a policy for budgetary monitoring and management.
The management of information systems	The institution develops a strategy for information systems. The institution has functional information systems.
The management of logistics' functions	The institution has appropriate logistics' functions fit for purpose. The institution manages its premises and spaces in an effective manner.
The welcoming of and support to students and staff	The institution puts in place a disposal for the welcoming and the orientation of students. The institution has in place information channels for students and staff.
Cultural, artistic and sports activities	The institution supports the creation and functioning of cultural, artistic and sports structures and associations. The institution has a strategy to develop artistic and sports activities.
Wellbeing conditions	The institution offers an appropriate wellbeing framework to all concerned stakeholders in fostering their intellectual and psychosocial conditions. The institution manages in an adequate way the questions related to the health of its stakeholders, and manages in an efficient manner questions related to health and security at work.
Corporate social responsibility (ethics, citizenship, equal opportunities, sustainable development, promotion of peace...)	The institution is committed to and encourages civil activities, exchange and debates. The institution is committed to the principles of equal opportunities. The institution respects rules of ethics and integrity.

7. Central Africa

7.1 Internal QA

Democratic Republic of the Congo		Description
Group	Standard	
		17 standards, grouped into four standard groups, as shown below. Descriptions have been translated from French.
Academic programmes	Academic programmes	The institution offers academic programmes in line with its missions, its environment (political, scientific, economic and socio-professional), and with the international context.
		Academic programmes align with the institution's project and/or strategic plan
		Academic programmes align with national, regional and international policies
		The institution has diffused information about its academic programmes (circulate information about the academic programmes it offers)
		Academic programmes are adapted to the institution's resources
		Academic programmes comply with the requirements of the Bachelor's/Licence-Master's-Doctorate higher education system in Europe.
		The institution applies a sustainable policy for tenure-track positions
		Academic programmes are designed to favour student mobility
		Academic programmes prepare students for professional integration
		The institution offers undergraduate and post-graduate academic programmes (remote learning, sandwich courses)
	Revision of programmes	Academic programmes are subject to regular assessment.
		The institution ensures ongoing pedagogical improvements.
		The institution has a validation strategy for learning throughout the educational pathway
		Assessment procedures align with learning objectives.
		Methods for assessing knowledge are objective, fair, reliable, published and communicated
		The institution ensures that the proclamation of exam results complies with the established methods and schedule.
		The institution offers students pedagogical support services to favour their success
		The institution favours the participation of students in institutional management
		The institution favours orientation and professional integration.
Research	Organisation, structuring and development of research	The institution has structures for managing and developing research
		The institution implements its priorities in terms of research
	Scientific relationships and partners.	The institution is positioned within the national, regional and international context of research
	Development of research.	The institution has a communication strategy for disseminating its scientific work
		The institution is positioned within the national, regional and international context of research
Governance	Exercise of governance autonomy	The institution and each of its components have functions
		Internal organisation favours efficient management of the institution
		A democratic debate exists within the institution thanks to the existence of different Boards
		Each year, the institution produces and has each of its different academic and research structures produce an activity report to demonstrate management transparency
	The institution and its components	The structure of the institution is adapted to the way it carries out its missions

The HAQAA Initiative · Central Africa

Democratic Republic of the Congo		Description
		The common departments contribute to implementing the institution's development plan or project
	Partnerships	The institution has a strategy for professional integration
		The institution has a strategy for international mobility
	Management of human resources	The institution has a strategy for managing employment and skills
	Financial management	The institution has the resources to implement its financial strategy
		The institution has a policy for budgetary monitoring and management
	Management of information systems	The institution develops an information system strategy
	Management of logistics functions	The institution has logistics functions that are adapted to its specific nature
		The institution rationally manages its buildings and spaces
	Quality assurance	The institution develops a well-defined and shared quality assurance policy
University life	Provide welcoming services and assistance to students and staff.	The institution implements a welcome and orientation plan for students
		The institution implements a welcome and orientation plan for staff
		The institution implements information plans for students and staff
	Cultural, artistic and sports activities.	The institution provides guidance for the creation and running of cultural, artistic and sports organisations and associations
	A living environment that stimulates intellectual and psychosocial growth	The institution offers a living environment that is suitable for all actors
		The institution properly manages the work health and safety of its actors
	Societal responsibility (ethics, civil rights, equal opportunities, sustainable development, promotion of peace)	The institution initiates and encourages civil activities, exchanges and debates
		The institution is committed to the principle of equal opportunities
		The institution respects rules of ethics and integrity

8. Creation of the European Higher Education Area

The setting up of EHEA is the result of the European-wide Bologna Process for the reform of higher education. The aim of the Bologna Process, as defined by the Bologna Declaration in 1999, from which the process takes its name, is to create a harmonised area for European higher education based on international cooperation and academic exchange that is attractive to European students and staff as well as to students and staff from other parts of the world (EHEA, 2017). The main objectives of the European Higher Education Area are to:

- facilitate mobility of students, graduates and higher education staff;
- prepare students for their future careers and for life as active citizens in democratic societies, and support their personal development;
- offer broad access to high-quality higher education, based on democratic principles and academic freedom.

As follow-up to the Bologna Declaration, a Ministerial Conference where the ministers of education gather and express their will through the respective Communiqués takes place every two or three years. Various ministerial meetings since 1999 have broadened the process and provided greater precision to the tools that have been developed for higher education. These include e.g. the three-cycle degree structure; national and European level qualifications frameworks; and a shared credit transfer and accumulation system (the ECTS) (EHEA, 2017). In addition, the concept of the social dimension of higher education has been given important focus, and especially the last years have been characterized by a shift to student-centered learning methods, and a focus on learning outcome (ESG, 2015).

The Bologna Process is a voluntary intergovernmental process which started with 29 signatory countries and has now come to cover 48 higher education systems that are parties to the European Cultural Convention. An important characteristic of the Bologna Process is that in addition to national ministries of the signatory countries, it also involves the European Commission, Council of Europe and UNESCO, as well as the European level representative organisations of higher education institutions¹⁴, students¹⁵, higher education institutions' staff¹⁶, employers¹⁷ and quality assurance agencies¹⁸ (EHEA, 2017).

QA has been one of the main pillars of the Bologna process from the very beginning, and maintains a key role in the development of the EHEA. In the latest report on the implementation of the Bologna Process, presented to the Ministerial Conference in Yerevan in May 2015, quality assurance was singled out as one of the success stories of the Bologna Process.

The two main quality assurance related milestones within the Bologna Process are (1) the adoption of a common set of standards for internal and external QA in Europe, namely the ESG in 2005; and (2) the establishment of the European Quality Assurance Register (EQAR) in 2008. EQAR is managing a register of quality assurance agencies that have demonstrated through an external review their compliance with the ESG. In 2012 the national ministers of the Bologna Process signatory countries asked the stakeholder organisations to carry out a revision of the ESG in order to improve their clarity and usefulness, and to take account of the developments in the EHEA since 2005. The revised version of the ESG was adopted by the ministers in Yerevan in May 2015 (EQAR, 2017.).

¹⁴ The European University Association (EUA) and the European Association of Institutions in Higher Education (EURASHE)

¹⁵ The European Students' Union (ESU)

¹⁶ Education International

¹⁷ Business Europe

¹⁸ European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA) <http://www.enqa.eu>

8.1 The Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area

The ESG were adopted by the Ministerial conference of the Bologna Process in 2005 following a proposal prepared by the European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA) in co-operation with the European Students' Union (ESU), the European Association of Institutions in Higher Education (EURASHE) and the European University Association (EUA). The ESG were created in order to provide a common framework for QA of higher education across Europe. As considerable progress has been made in QA as well as in other Bologna Process action lines (qualifications frameworks, recognition and the promotion of the use of learning outcomes) since 2005, in 2012 the Ministerial Communiqué invited the stakeholder organisations (this time including also Education International, representing HE teachers, BUSINESSSEUROPE representing the world of work, and the European Quality Assurance Register (EQAR)) to prepare an initial proposal for a revised version of the ESG to improve their clarity, applicability and usefulness, including their scope. The revision included several consultation rounds involving key stakeholders as well as ministries and the final version reflects a consensus among all the organisations involved on how to take forward quality assurance in the EHEA (ESG, 2015).

The ESG are a set of standards and guidelines for internal and external QA in higher education. The ESG are not standards for quality, as such, and they do not prescribe how the quality assurance processes are implemented, but they provide guidance, and indicate the areas that are vital for quality in higher education. The ESG are “generic principles” that allow for diversity of practical implementation, and underline that “a single monolithic approach to quality and quality assurance in higher education” in the EHEA is not appropriate due to the diversity in approaches and higher education traditions across the area. In other words, the ESG describe “what” should be achieved, rather than “how” it should be done (ESG, 2015).

The purposes of the ESG are to provide a common framework for QA in Europe; to enable the assurance and improvement of quality of higher education; to support mutual trust; and to provide information on quality assurance in the EHEA.

The ESG 2015 are based on the following four principles:

- 1) the primary responsibility lies with higher education institutions for the quality and QA of their provision;
- 2) QA needs to respond to the diversity of higher education systems, institutions, programmes, and students;
- 3) QA needs to support the creation of a quality culture; and
- 4) QA takes into account the needs and expectations of students, other stakeholders, and the society.

The focus of the ESG is on QA related to learning and teaching in higher education, and while they also consider the overall learning environment and the relevant links of teaching and learning to research and innovation, they do not address the quality assurance of these elements directly. The ESG apply to all higher education offered in the EHEA regardless of the mode of study or place of delivery. This means that the ESG cover equally e-learning and traditional face-to-face learning, as well as cross-border provision of institutions in the EHEA. They are composed of three parts addressing (1) internal QA, (2) external QA, and (3) the QA of the QAAs in higher education. All three parts are an integral part of a well-functioning QA system (ESG, 2015.).

8.2 Implementation of the ESG and the external review system of QA agencies in Europe

The ESG are a part of the Bologna Process, and consequently, all participating countries have committed to implementing them in their higher education systems. While there is no obligatory European level accreditation of HEIs or degree programmes, the implementation of the ESG at all levels is assured through

the verified ESG compliance of the quality assurance agencies. The QAAs located in the EHEA will take part in an external review process, usually coordinated by ENQA, through which they may demonstrate their compliance with the ESG (ENQA, 2017).

The review process covers four key stages:

- (1) a self-assessment by the agency;
- (2) a site visit by a group of independent experts (including a student member);
- (3) an external review report which is made public; and
- (4) a follow-up procedure to monitor progress in meeting the requirements of the ESG.

In the ENQA Agency Review model, the external review is based on certain key principles, including e.g. the following:

- a review is an evidence-based process carried out by independent experts;
- the information provided by the agency under review is assumed to be factually correct unless other evidence points to the contrary;
- a review is a process of verification of the information provided in the self-assessment report (SAR) and other documentation and the exploration of any matters which are omitted from that documentation;
- the process is transparent and outputs are published;
- the reviews aim at verifying compliance, but in particular for the second and subsequent reviews, also at striving for improvement.

The agency review is based on the standards and guidelines in parts 2 and 3 of the ESG. In addition, the expert panel verifies that the agency addresses systematically all standards of part 1 (regarding internal QA of higher education institutions) in its external QA processes (ENQA, 2017).

An agency which is in substantial compliance with the ESG overall may apply to become a member of ENQA, the representative organisation of QAAs in Europe, and to be listed in EQAR, the European Quality Assurance Register. EQAR provides the official listing of ESG compliant QAAs in the EHEA. The decision on registration in EQAR is taken by an independent Register Committee composed of representatives of different stakeholder groups. The decision is based on the external review report, on a holistic assessment of compliance. A positive decision on registration is valid for five years, after which the agency can ask for a renewal subject to another successful review process (EQAR, 2017).

Currently, in 27 countries of the EHEA (out of 48), there is an ESG compliant QA agency or – in some cases - several agencies. In the remaining countries, the agency has not yet passed an external review against the ESG, yet, or there is no independent QAA at all at this stage (ENQA, 2017).

8.3 Quality procedures in the EHEA

As mentioned above, the ESG apply to all HEIs, as well as to all QAAs in the EHEA, independently of the type of QA activities carried out. Indeed, there is a great variety of approaches to external QA across European countries (ENQA, 2008).

According to an ENQA study carried out in 2008, the most common external quality procedures are evaluation and accreditation, followed by institutional audits. A large majority of agencies used, in 2008, programme level procedures in their external QA whereas institutional level procedures were only applied by about 40 percent of the agencies. These ratios did not differ between evaluation and accreditation approaches. At the same time, most of the agencies (about 90%) were not restricted to only one type of QA procedure. In fact, some of them conduct most types of procedures (evaluation, audit and accreditation). Considering the most frequently applied approaches many (~50%) of the agencies that conduct programme evaluation also conduct accreditation of programmes and evaluation of institutions, and the other way

around. It should be noted that this information gives an approximate picture as the study was carried out in 2008 (ENQA, 2008).

The HAQAA Initiative · Creation of the European Higher Education Area

Table 9: Table of international and regional standards and guidelines for QA

No.	Acronym	Name	Type of provision	Area of use	Targeted at	No. of countries implemented in	Links
1	CHEA	Recognition of accrediting organisations. Policy and procedures.	All	United States	QAAs Networks of agencies	1	Click here
2	CHIBA Principles	Higher Education Quality Assurance Principles for the Asia Pacific Region	All	Asia-Pacific	Institutions QAAs	Not known	Click here
3	CIQG	CHEA international quality group. International quality principles.	All	International	Higher education stakeholders Institutions Student bodies QAAs Recognition bodies Professional bodies	Not known	Click here
4	ESG	Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG)	All	European Higher Education Area	Institutions QAAs Networks of agencies	27/48	Click here Comparison between old and new ESG
5	INQAAHE	INQAAHE Guidelines of Good Practice	All	International	QAAs Networks of agencies	16	Click here
6	QACHE Toolkit	Toolkit for Quality Assurance Agencies	Cross-border	International	QAAs Networks of agencies	Not known	Click here
7	UNESCO-OECD Guidelines	Guidelines for Quality Provision in Cross-border Higher Education	Cross-border	International	Higher education stakeholders Institutions Student bodies QAAs Recognition bodies Professional bodies	~44	Click here Report on implementation
8	UNESCO-APQN Toolkit	UNESCO/APQN Toolkit: Regulating the Quality of Cross-border Education	Cross-border	International Asia-Pacific	Higher education stakeholders QAAs Institutions Recognition bodies Student bodies Networks of agencies	Not known	Click here

9. Annexes

- Annex I: Inter-university Council for East Africa (IUCEA), 2014, Principles and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in Higher Education in Eastern Africa.
- Annex II: Zimbabwe Council for Higher Education, Quality Assurance Standards for Higher Education.
- Annex III: Higher Education Council, Rwanda, Standards and Guidelines for Open and Distance Learning.
- Annex IV: Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU), 2014, Quality Assurance General Guidelines and Minimum Standards for Provision of University Education in Tanzania.
- Annex V: National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education (NAQAEE), Egypt, 2015, Accreditation Standards for HEIs, 3rd ed.
- Annex VI: Commission for University Education, Kenya, 2014, Universities Standards and Guidelines.
- Annex VII: Conselho Nacional de Avaliacao de Qualidade do Ensino Superior (CNAQ), Mozambique, Mapa de indicadores, padrões e critérios de verificação.
- Annex VIII: Council on Higher Education (CHE), Lesotho, Institutional Audit Framework for Higher Education.
- Annex IX: Conseil Africain et Malgache Pour L'Enseignement Superieur (CAMES), 2014, Appui a L'Assurance Qualite de l'Enseignement Superieur et de la Recherche dans les pays de l'espace CAMES.
- Annex X: Council on Higher Education (CHE), South Africa, 2004, Criteria for Institutional Audits.
- Annex XI: The Southern Africa Development Community (SADC), Technical Committee on Certification and Accreditation (TCCA), 2008, Proposed Common Guidelines for Coordinating Education Quality Assurance in the SADC Region.
- Annex XII: National Council for Higher Education (NCHE), Namibia, 2009, Quality Assurance System for Higher Education in Namibia.
- Annex XIII: Comission for University Education, Kenya, 2013, Standards and Guidelines for Open, Distance and E-learning (ODEL).
- Annex XIV: Tertiary Education Commission, Mauritius, Regulatory Framework for Postsecondary Education, Criteria for Academic Audit.
- Annex XV: Autorite Nationale D'assurance Qualite De L'enseignement Superieur (ANAQ-SUP), Senegal, 2013, Referentiel D'Evaluation Institutionnelle.
- Annex XVI: The Arab Network for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ANQAHE), Common Institutional Standards in the Arab States.
- Annex XVII: Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA), 2006, HERQA Institutional Audit Procedure.
- Annex XVIII: Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA), 2014, Quality Assurance Policy.
- Annex XIX: Malawi Bureau of Standards (MSB), Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in Malawi's higher education institutions.
- Annex XX: National Universities Commission (NUC), 2007, Benchmark Minimum Academic Standards (BMAS) documents, classified into 13 major disciplines for Nigerian universities.
- Annex XXI: National Council for Tertiary Education, 2012, Norms for Tertiary Education (Universities).
- Annex XXII: Ensemble pour la Qualité (CIAQES/MESRS), 2016, Référentiel National de l'Assurance Qualité. Domaines, Champs, Références.
- Annex XXIII: The Higher Education Authority, Zambia, 2015, The Quality Assurance System for Higher Education in Zambia.
- Annex XXIV: National Training Authority, Gambia, 2007, Registration and Accreditation for Training Providers.
- Annex XXV: Agence Nationale d'Assurance Qualite (ANAQ), Republique Democratique du Congo, 2016, Referentiel d'Evaluation Institutionnelle.

10. References

European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education (ENQA). Available at:

<http://www.enqa.eu/>

European Higher Education Area (EHEA). Available at: <http://www.ehea.info/>

European Quality Assurance Register (EQAR). Available at: <http://eqar.eu/>

Okebukola, 2014, Quality Assurance in Higher Education in Africa. Lagos, OSF Press.

Quality Procedures in the European Higher Education Area and Beyond – Second ENQA Survey (2008).

Available at: [http://www.enqa.eu/indirme/papers-and-reports/occasional-](http://www.enqa.eu/indirme/papers-and-reports/occasional-papers/ENQA%20Occasional%20papers%2014.pdf)

[papers/ENQA%20Occasional%20papers%2014.pdf](http://www.enqa.eu/indirme/papers-and-reports/occasional-papers/ENQA%20Occasional%20papers%2014.pdf)

Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (2015). Available

at: <http://www.enqa.eu/index.php/home/esg/>

United Nations (2018): List of geographic regions. Available at:

<https://unstats.un.org/unsd/methodology/m49/>